



**MINUTES**

**Tennessee Public Charter School Commission Meeting**

Tuesday, July 13, 2021 | 9:00 a.m. CT

Video Recording:

<https://dgs.streamingvideo.tn.gov/Mediasite/Play/b89858fdd245471bb4d4e1a1583f53ee1d>

**Note:** These minutes correspond to the video recording. Each item has a minute counter assigned to the subject location in the audio file.

**Welcome and Call-to-Order**

**00:00:00-00:03:37**

Tom Griscom, Commission Chairman, called the meeting to order.

**Roll Call**

Action of the Commission

<b>Roll Call/Quorum</b>	
Dave Hanson	Present
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Present
Chris Richards	Present
Derwin Sisnett	Present
Eddie Smith	Present
Wendy Tucker	Present
Tom Griscom	Present
Jamie Woodson	Present
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 present; quorum established.	

**Approval of Agenda**

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Meeting Agenda</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; agenda approved	



**Approval of Prior Minutes**

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Prior Minutes for April 9, 2021</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Derwin Sisnett</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; minutes approved	

**Public Comment**

**00:03:37-00:14:55**

Chase Ingle, Director of External Affairs, read a written comment from Megan Quaile with Green Dot Public Schools, at her request. (The comment is attached.)

Bob Nardo, with Libertas School of Memphis, personally appeared to present public comment. (The comment is attached.)

**Charter Agreement Waivers**

**00:14:55-00:17:54**

Ashley Thomas, General Counsel, presented waivers for KIPP Antioch College Prep Middle School and KIPP Antioch College Prep Elementary School.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of KIPP Antioch College Prep Middle School Waivers</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Chris Richards</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	



Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of KIPP Antioch College Prep Elementary School Waivers</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Wendy Tucker</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

**Business Operations Committee Report**

**00:17:54-00:33:05**

Dave Hanson, Chairman of the Business Operations Committee, recognized Melanie Harrell, Director of Finance and Operations.

Melanie Harrell reviewed the FY 2021 budget to actuals, the FY 2022 updated budget, and the FY 2023 proposed budget.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of the revised budget for FY 2022</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Derwin Sisnett   Seconded by: Eddie Smith</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of proposed budget for FY 2023</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Chris Richards   Seconded by: Terence Patterson</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes



Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Tess Stovall present proposed 2022 meeting dates to the Commission.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of 2022 meeting dates</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Wendy Tucker</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

**School Performance and Accountability Committee Report**

**00:33:05-01:04:53**

Chris Richards, Chairman of the School Performance and Accountability Committee recognized Tess Stovall and Melanie Harrell. Tess and Melanie presented the school operations update, the ESSER funding update, and the Consolidated Funding Application update.

**Rules, Policy and Governance Committee Report**

**01:04:53-01:20:33**

Terence Patterson, Chairman of the Rules, Policy and Governance Committee, recognized Ashley Thomas to review changes to LEA policies 2805, 3201, 4400, 6200, 6309, 6313, 6317 and 6500.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of changes to LEA Policies 2805, 3201, 4400, 6200, 6309, 6313, 6317 and 6500 on first and final reading</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Dave Hanson   Seconded by: Terence Patterson</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes



Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Terence Patterson recognized Ashley Thomas to review Commission policies 1000, 2000 and 3000.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Commission policies 1000, 2000 and 3000 on final reading</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Dave Hanson</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Terence Patterson recognized Ashley Thomas to review the Amendment Appeals Emergency Rule.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Amendment Appeals Emergency Rule and on first and final reading</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Derwin Sisnett</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Terence Patterson recognized Ashley Thomas to review the Amendment Appeals Permanent Rule.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Amendment Appeals Permanent Rule on first reading</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Eddie Smith   Seconded by: Jamie Woodson</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes



Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Terence Patterson recognized Ashley Thomas and Tess Stovall to review the Achievement School District Authorization Permanent Rule.

Action of the Commission

<b>Approval of Achievement School District Authorization Permanent Rule on first reading</b>	
<b>Motion made by: Wendy Tucker   Seconded by: Jamie Woodson</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

**Break**

**01:20:33-01:33:02**

**Governor Bill Lee**

**01:33:02-01:43:54**

Governor Bill Lee appeared before the Commission to express gratitude and appreciation for their dedication in helping the Tennessee Public Charter School Commission become successful.

**ASD Exit Legislation Implementation**

**01:43:54-02:41:09**

Dr. Eve Carney, with the Tennessee Department of Education, and Tess Stovall presented an update on the implementation of the ASD Exit Plan legislation to the Commissioners.

**Executive Director Updates**

**02:41:09-03:14:35**

Tess Stovall provided the Executive Director’s update and presented the draft application/rubric for use by ASD operators to the Commission.

**Closing Discussion and Adjournment**

**03:14:35-03:14:48**

Action of the Commission

<b>Motion to adjourn meeting</b>
----------------------------------



<b>Motion made by: Derwin Sisnett   Seconded by: Eddie Smith</b>	
Dave Hanson	Yes
Alan Levine	Absent
Terence Patterson	Yes
Chris Richards	Yes
Derwin Sisnett	Yes
Eddie Smith	Yes
Wendy Tucker	Yes
Jamie Woodson	Yes
Tom Griscom	Yes
<b>Outcome:</b> 8 of 9 voting; motion approved	

Chairman Griscom adjourned the meeting.

Public Comments are attached.

July 12, 2021

Public Comment for Tennessee Charter Commission:

I apologize for not attending this meeting in person. Green Dot is preparing the launch of a turnaround school in Texas next month – this time in partnership with a local school district – and I have a conflicting commitment. I wanted to go on record to share that we are honored that Bluff City High School is now a part of the Tennessee Charter Commission. The State Board of Education proved a quality authorizer and supportive partner during our first years operating Bluff City High School. We are grateful that Tess Stovall and her team will bring that same integrity and skill to their work at the Charter Commission.

I am aware that discussion will begin today about the ASD as Eve Carney shares the TDOE's planned exit criteria. While I have not seen the exit criteria, I appreciate the TDOE's effort to bring clarity to the process. Frankly, the ambiguity has caused a fair amount of anxiety for the past two years in our school communities. Our students, families, and school teams deserve to know what is expected of us.

As the Charter Commission considers its own criteria for approving turnaround school applications, I would ask that you consider multiple measures of student growth. The current iteration of the ASD School Performance Framework relies almost exclusively on state testing, which proves problematic for turnaround schools for myriad reasons, including:

- State testing has been substantively interrupted 4 of the 7 years that Green Dot has worked in Tennessee. In addition to challenges to the validity of scores during years where online testing was interrupted or cancelled, it is important to note that multiple years of testing are required to derive a TVAAS score. Consequently, the veracity of recent TVAAS scores must be examined.
- At Green Dot high schools, only 7 of the 28 (25%) courses a student takes are assessed by TNReady (with 5 of those tests occurring in 9<sup>th</sup> or 10<sup>th</sup> grade). Middle schools encounter the highest concentration of state assessment of any grade level configuration, with all three grades taking four core subject tests. Therefore, it could be assumed that TVAAS is a more comprehensive measure of student learning at the middle school level. And yet, in 2019, 68% of the middle schools across Tennessee earned a school-wide TVAAS score of either a 1 or 5. Optically, this amounts to more of a binary pass/fail score than a thorough evaluation of growth.
- The process of turnaround is not linear, nor is it immediate. Each year, Green Dot assesses students at the beginning of the school year on iReady for reading and math. The ASD was not able to achieve its early goal of creating K-12 feeder patterns. As a result, every year entering 6<sup>th</sup> grade students are three years behind in reading on average. In this case, each school year one third of the students entering the building are significantly behind. While we can demonstrate growth on nationally normed reading tests, they may not be as clear on a content test like TN-Ready.

The current SBE Performance Framework does assess schools on a more comprehensive set of metrics. If this rubric is employed, I would ask for consideration that Comparison Scores look at similar schools rather comparing turnaround school scores to full district averages. I would also hope that the Charter Commission follows the SBE's lead in valuing school culture metrics like suspension rates and attendance as they paint a more robust picture of school success.

I look forward to continuing discussions about key metrics of turnaround success. I would also like to extend an open invitation for the Commissioners to visit Bluff City or any of our schools this fall.

Sincerely,



Megan Quaile, Ed.D.  
Executive Director

**COLLEGE.  
LEADERSHIP.  
LIFE.**



**COLLEGE.  
LEADERSHIP.  
LIFE.**



Public comments about plans for ASD transition and the TN Charter School Commission | July 13, 2021

We thank the General Assembly, Gov. Lee, and the Charter Commission for the opportunity to continue the critical work for transforming neighborhood schools. While ASD may not yet have reached its initial dreams, this should not obscure the tremendous improvement we have indeed seen in many places thanks to the state's vision and investment (please see attached highlights). The children and families in our priority school communities hope for clarity on what our school needs to do to continue providing them with a quality public school choice. We are grateful for the chance to provide feedback to both the Commission and TDE on the proposed transition timeline, criteria, application / rubric, and performance framework. Please consider the following points:

- We request a definition of success by the beginning of the school year. The goals should be rigorous and realistic to encourage schools to serve the most vulnerable students.
- Current ASD school performance framework no longer has the nationally normed test for growth (thus relies exclusively on TVAAS, which varies significantly with small sample sizes in priority schools); does not include chronic absences; and still utilizes pre-ESSA targets on TCAP for proficiency - which are no longer realistic under TN Ready.
- "Priority exit" criteria - e.g. reaching 15th percentile success rate - may miss schools that started in the 1st percentile and made significant progress without yet having had the full testing opportunities anticipated in the charter agreement because of state testing issues. (The special ASD application initially accommodates this with a success rate of 10%+.)
- Comparative academic performance should look not just at the "resident district," which can have overall demographics and student needs that are very different, but rather at comparable schools - e.g. priority schools or others in the neighborhood. (The special ASD application adapts for this initially with a proficiency target at/above ASD grade span average.)
- Chronic absenteeism: reducing this rate is crucial, but, for context, a "meets expectations" target of 15% would be well lower than the 20% we earned in the last full year (2019) - down from 36% before turnaround - let alone the 25% ASD elementary average that year. A school making its AMO (or double, as we did) would soon find the goal ratcheted down to an unrealistic level for priority zones. All these numbers likely need re-norming post-pandemic.
- Discipline: similarly to attendance, an admirable "meets expectations" suspension rate of 3% contrasts to a 2019 rate of 6% in our school, which was half the 12.5% among ASD elementary schools, and well below the 24%+ before we started turnaround. (The special ASD application reasonably allows initially for attendance and discipline at/below ASD average.)
- Attrition: another data point heavily influenced by being in highly transient priority zones: the current goal says 15-24%, but our best is about 17% - itself better than priority school averages.
- Special education is included as a compliance item, but should also receive consideration for the academic score (e.g. bonus points for equity) for schools serving disproportionately high needs: we have 24% overall disabilities (more than double the charter school average) and 10% high-need (10 times greater than the average in SCS charters). Finally, please consider a district-level weighted funding pool for high-need special education students, to ensure that appropriate dollars follow the child so that meaningful choice will exist in Commission schools.