

**DATE:** January 26, 2017  
**SUBJECT:** Academic Program Review  
**ACTION RECOMMENDED:** Information

As Tennessee’s institutions of higher education continue to focus on the goals of completion and student success, there is a clear need for an ongoing evaluation of the state’s academic programs. Recent years have seen a period of extensive growth in the current academic program inventory coupled with concerns that a significant number of programs are failing to meet productivity thresholds. Therefore, THEC performs an annual Academic Program Review which examines new programs across the state.

THEC works with governing boards and institutions to assess the health of academic offerings, make necessary adjustments to academic program policy, and ensure all programs are fully aligned to student success. As the state continues to move toward 55 percent of Tennesseans obtaining a college degree or certificate by 2025, it is vital that our institutions of higher education provide students with high quality academic programs.

The Academic Program Review provides a holistic view of the status of degree programs throughout the state, and includes the following components:

- **Program Activity:** Depicts new academic programs added to the state inventory in 2016, as well as programs that have been terminated.
- **Post Approval Monitoring:** Assesses success of newly approved academic programs against projected enrollment and graduation benchmarks.

**Program Activity**

The Commission has the statutory responsibility to review and approve new academic programs, while responsibility for program termination lies with the governing boards. However, Commission staff may recommend termination to the TBR and UT systems. The FOCUS Act also requires that institutions report annually on any academic program terminations to the General Assembly and THEC.

During 2016, the Commission approved four new academic programs and 15 programs received approval for modifications from the THEC Executive Director. The Board of Regents approved 20 pre-baccalaureate programs. The governing

boards terminated 53 programs. A complete listing of new academic programs, program modifications, and terminations can be found in Appendix A.

**Table 1: New Academic Programs, Modifications and Terminations, 2016**

	<b>New Programs</b>	<b>Modified Programs</b>	<b>Terminations</b>	<b>Net Change</b>
TBR Universities	4	14	4	+14
UT System	0	1	8	-7
TBR Community Colleges	20	--	41	-21
<b>Total Actions</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>-14</b>

- All new academic program activity in 2016 occurred at Tennessee Board of Regents institutions. Eighty percent of new academic programs were approved by TBR for community colleges, and the most common areas of growth were Trades and Industry followed by Health Professions and Computer Information Sciences.
- Fifteen academic programs were approved through Academic Policy A1.1 which allows the THEC Executive Director to approve program modifications. The most common program modification was the result of the separation of a concentration from an existing program to establish a free standing academic program.
- The majority of programs terminated in 2016 were at TBR community colleges with a significant number of these programs being offered though TN eCampus. The remaining terminations included one baccalaureate degree, five master’s degrees and six doctoral degrees.

**Table 2: Trends in New Academic Programs, 2012-2016**

<b>New Programs</b>	<b>2012</b>	<b>2013</b>	<b>2014</b>	<b>2015</b>	<b>2016</b>
TBR Universities	1	6	7	8	4
UT System	2	2	0	4	0
TBR Community Colleges	45	29	27	15	20
<b>Total Actions</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>24</b>

- Over the last five years, there has been a decline in the number of new academic programs approved each year.
- Overall, the number of programs approved annually by the Commission has grown since 2012, despite a 12 month moratorium on new programs that occurred from July from 2014-2015. However, there were fewer new programs approved by the Commission in 2016 than 2015.

**Table 3: Trends in Academic Program Terminations, 2012-2016**

<b>Program Terminations</b>	<b>2012</b>	<b>2013</b>	<b>2014</b>	<b>2015</b>	<b>2016</b>
TBR Universities	2	4	3	3	4
UT System	1	0	3	1	8
TBR Community Colleges	19	1	9	7	41
<b>Total Actions</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>53</b>

- Between 2012 and 2015, there has been an overall decline in the number of programs terminated annually by the governing boards.
- However, 2016 had a record number of programs terminated in a single year with the same number of programs being terminated in 2016 as the previous four years combined.

### Post Approval Monitoring

Newly approved programs are evaluated through the Post Approval Monitoring (PAM) process. The PAM evaluates academic programs against enrollment and graduate projections, program cost, and other goals agreed upon by the governing boards and THEC. The PAM cycle is three years for pre-baccalaureate programs and five years at the baccalaureate and master's level. Effective with the revised academic policy in 2015, new doctoral programs are monitored for a seven-year period.

In 2016, a total of 61 programs participated in PAM. Over half of all programs in PAM were certificate and associate degree programs at the TBR community colleges. The UT System made up roughly 13 percent of programs in PAM. A total of eight programs completed Post Approval Monitoring in 2016, five associate programs and three master's programs.

**Table 4: Programs in Post Approval Monitoring, 2016**

	<b>Certificate &amp; Associate</b>	<b>Bachelor</b>	<b>Master's</b>	<b>Doctoral</b>	<b>Total</b>
TBR Universities	-	5	12	4	21
UT System	-	1	1	6	8
TBR Community Colleges	32	-	-	-	32
<b>Total Programs in PAM</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>61</b>

Enrollment and graduation benchmarks for programs are developed by each institution and failure to meet these benchmarks can impact the institution substantially. For example, if the institution does not enroll the projected number of students then there may be a deficit in tuition receipts, and thus, a financial burden to the institution.

In 2016, there were 14 academic programs that failed to meet both enrollment and graduation benchmarks: eight pre-baccalaureate, five master’s and one doctoral. There are various reasons why programs may not meet projected benchmarks. Sometimes the implementation of programs are delayed due to difficulty hiring faculty, inadequate recruitment practices, changes in labor market demands, or other issues not within the control of the institution. For example, the Professional Science Master’s program at Tennessee State University lost two key faculty members and two critical staff members. In addition, there was a delay in adding the program into the online application system for the School of Graduate Studies and Research. The staff departure and delay in adding the program to the application system has caused a delay in the program meeting enrollment and graduation benchmarks. The reason for not meeting benchmarks may also be tied to when a program receives accreditation as with the Occupational Therapy doctoral program at UT Chattanooga. The program received national accreditation in April 2016, and has seen a substantial increase in the number of applicants which will increase the chances that enrollment and graduation benchmarks will be met going forward.

Programs that did not meet benchmarks during the monitoring period completed a Program Productivity Plan that addressed deficiencies and provided specific plans for corrective actions. The Program Productivity Plan serves to help improve the program by helping institutions formulate a strategy to address enrollment, retention and completion goals. For example, through the Program Productivity Plan the Fine Arts associate program at Roane State has initiated a marketing campaign and identified potential events on campus to help recruit students and increase enrollment.

Programs that have completed PAM are monitored by THEC through the Quality Assurance Funding program. Programs that are underperforming at the end of the monitoring cycle are in true peril of failing to reach the institutionally developed projections that indicate success. Underperforming programs that complete PAM are monitored by THEC through the Low Producing Program evaluation. THEC can recommend termination of those programs that do not, over the monitoring period, show improvement.

**Table 5: 2016 Post Approval Monitoring Certificate and Associate Programs**

	Institution	Academic Program	Degree Level	Implementation Term/Year	Monitoring Year	Met Enrollment Benchmark	Met Graduation Benchmark
1	Chattanooga	Hospitality and Tourism Management	Associate	Spring 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		N/A
2	Cleveland	Paramedic	Certificate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		x
3	Cleveland	Paramedic	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>	x	N/A
4	Cleveland	Medical Informatics	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		N/A
5	Northeast	Aviation Maintenance Technology	Certificate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		

	Institution	Academic Program	Degree Level	Implementation Term/Year	Monitoring Year	Met Enrollment Benchmark	Met Graduation Benchmark
6	Roane	Mechatronics Technology	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>	x	x
7	Southwest	Allied Health Science	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		
8	Southwest	Fire Science	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		N/A
9	Volunteer	Computer Information Technology	Associate	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>	x	
10	Dyersburg	Advanced Integrated Industrial Technology	Associate	Spring 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>	x	
11	Motlow	Emergency Medical Services	Associate	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>	x	
12	Northeast	Entertainment Technology- Sound and Lighting	Certificate	Spring 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
13	Roane	Financial Services	Associate	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
14	Roane	Medical Informatics	Associate	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
15	Roane	Surgical Technology	Associate	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
16	Walters	Surgical Technology	Associate	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
17	Motlow	Mechatronics Technology	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	
18	Nashville	Medical Informatics*	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>		
19	Southwest	Advanced Integrated Industrial Tech	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>		
20	Volunteer	Entertainment Media Production	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	
21	Volunteer	Fine Arts	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	
22	Volunteer	Medical Informatics	Associate	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	

*\*Programs terminated effective August 2016.*

- Five associate programs completed monitoring in 2016. The Advanced Integrated Industrial Technology associate program at Southwest was scheduled to complete monitoring in 2016; however, the program will continued to be monitored through 2019 as the program failed to meet both enrollment and graduation benchmarks.
- Programs not meeting either enrollment or graduation benchmarks:
  - Northeast: Aviation Maintenance Technology and Entertainment Technology Sound and Lighting certificate programs
  - Roane: Medical Informatics, Financial Services, and Surgical Technology associate programs
  - Southwest: Allied Health Science and Advanced Integrated Industrial Technology associate programs
  - Walters: Surgical Technology associate program

**Table 6: 2016 Post Approval Monitoring  
Baccalaureate Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Implementation Term/Year</b>	<b>Monitoring Year</b>	<b>Met Enrollment Benchmark</b>	<b>Met Graduation Benchmark</b>
1	Austin Peay Middle	Theatre/Dance	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>	x	x
2	Tennessee Middle	Theatre	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>	x	x
3	Tennessee	Mechatronics Engineering	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	x
4	Tennessee Tech	Environmental and Sustainability Studies	Fall 2012	4 <sup>th</sup>		x
5	UT Chattanooga	Integrated Studies	Fall 2012	4 <sup>th</sup>	x	x

- Five baccalaureate programs were evaluated through PAM in 2016.
- Four of the five baccalaureate programs met both enrollment and graduate benchmarks.

**Table 7: 2016 Post Approval Monitoring  
Master's Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Implementation Term/Year</b>	<b>Monitoring Year</b>	<b>Met Enrollment Benchmark</b>	<b>Met Graduation Benchmark</b>
1	Middle Tennessee	Finance	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>		
2	Middle Tennessee	Liberal Arts	Fall 2015	1 <sup>st</sup>	x	
3	Austin Peay	Engineering Technology	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
4	Tennessee State	Professional Science Master's	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
5	Tennessee State	Computer Science	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>	x	x
6	UT Knoxville	Creative Writing	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		x
7	Austin Peay Middle	Computer Science & Quantitative Methods	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	x
8	Tennessee	Management	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>	x	x
9	Tennessee Tech Middle	Professional Science Master's	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>		
10	Tennessee	International Affairs	Fall 2012	4 <sup>th</sup>		

	Institution	Academic Program	Implementation Term/Year	Monitoring Year	Met Enrollment Benchmark	Met Graduation Benchmark
11	Middle Tennessee	Information Systems	Fall 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>	x	x
12	Middle Tennessee	Leisure and Sport Management	Fall 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>		x
13	Univ of Memphis	Social Work	Fall 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>		x

- Thirteen master’s programs were evaluated through PAM and three completed monitoring in 2016.
- Programs not meeting both enrollment and graduation benchmarks:
  - Austin Peay State University: Engineering Technology
  - Middle Tennessee State University: Finance and International Affairs
  - Tennessee State University: Professional Science Master’s
  - Tennessee Technological University: Professional Science Master’s

**Table 8: 2016 Post Approval Monitoring  
Doctoral Programs**

	Institution	Academic Program	Implementation Term/Year	Monitoring Year	Met Enrollment Benchmark	Met Graduation Benchmark
1	UT Knoxville	Entomology, Plant Pathology and Nematology	Fall 2015	Delayed	N/A	N/A
2	UT Knoxville	Public Health	Fall 2015	Delayed	N/A	N/A
3	Univ of Memphis	Health Systems and Policy	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>	x	N/A
4	UT Chattanooga	Occupational Therapy	Fall 2014	2 <sup>nd</sup>		
5	Middle Tennessee	Assessment, Learning and School Improvement	Fall 2013	3 <sup>rd</sup>		x
6	Univ of Memphis	Epidemiology	Fall 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>	x	
7	UT Knoxville	Nursing	Spring 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>	x	
8	UT Knoxville	Energy Science and Engineering	Fall 2011	5 <sup>th</sup>	x	x
9	Univ of Memphis	Social and Behavioral Science	Spring 2010	6 <sup>th</sup>		
10	UT Chattanooga	Nursing Practice	Spring 2011	6 <sup>th</sup>		x

- Ten doctoral programs were evaluated through PAM in 2016, six UT programs and four TBR programs.
- At the University of Memphis, three doctoral programs – Health Systems and Policy, Epidemiology, and Social and Behavioral Science are in the School of Public Health. These doctoral programs are closely related but distinct programs. Given the shared resources of these programs, University of Memphis received approval to combine the graduation target with the expectation of three graduates per year across the three Public Health doctoral programs. However, the programs failed to meet this combined benchmark.

By the end of 2015, eleven programs completed post-approval monitoring but failed to meet both enrollment and graduation benchmarks and therefore remained on monitoring status through 2016. These programs and their current status are reflected in Table 8.

**Table 8: Under-Performing Programs: Monitoring Cycle Extended**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>	<b>Graduates</b>
<b>1</b>	University of Memphis	Interior Design	Bachelors	2015-16, 2 graduates
<b>Status Update:</b> (34 graduates since implementation in Fall 2010) Enrollment and graduation benchmarks were met in 2010 and 2011; however there has been a decline in both metrics over the last three years.				
<b>2</b>	Columbia	Advanced Integrated Industrial Technology	Associate	2015-16, 8 graduates
<b>Status Update:</b> (14 graduates since implementation in Fall 2012) Columbia received a Leap 2.0 grant to offer dual enrollment coursework for this program in Fall 2017. Twenty additional students are expected in this program by Fall 2017 due to this expansion.				
<b>3-9</b>	TBR Community Colleges	Fine Arts	Associate	1.3 average annual graduates per program
<b>Status Update:</b> Implemented in Fall 2012, the Fine Arts programs are utilizing various strategies to increase enrollment. These efforts may take several years to produce graduates sufficient to meet benchmarks.				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Chattanooga:</b> (10 graduates total) Program failed to meet enrollment or graduation benchmarks since the program was implemented. Students in the program now complete an education plan early in the AFA coursework to help ensure there is a clear path to graduation.</li> <li>• <b>Cleveland:</b> (3 graduates total) Enrollment and graduation benchmarks are not meet but there are improvements over previous years. In Fall 2015, the program partnered with the Cleveland Community Band in order to serve a greater variety of students.</li> <li>• <b>Columbia:</b> (7 graduates total) Program exceeded the minimum benchmark for graduates in 2015-16 and is working to utilize the new Williamson County campus to draw additional AFA majors.</li> <li>• <b>Dyersburg:</b> (6 graduates total) Program was terminated effective Fall 2016.</li> <li>• <b>Nashville:</b> (2 graduates total) There were 72 students enrolled in this program for the fall 2016 semester which suggest that the established benchmarks will be met in the future.</li> <li>• <b>Roane:</b> (0 graduates total) The program has met enrollment benchmarks with the assistance of promotional materials which highlight various programs of study, course offerings and scholarship opportunities.</li> <li>• <b>Walters:</b> (9 graduates total) In 2015 and 2016 the program met enrollment benchmarks, but has only reached 50 percent of the graduation benchmark. The program is working to increase retention by sequencing courses to ensure a seamless transfer to universities is available.</li> </ul>				



	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>	<b>Graduates</b>
<b>10-11</b>	TBR Community Colleges	Health Sciences	Associate	1.6 average annual graduates per program
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Cleveland:</b> (7 graduates since implementation in Fall 2012) In 2016, the program meet graduation benchmarks for the first time; however the program continues to fall below 50 percent of the enrollment benchmark.</li> <li>• <b>Pellissippi:</b> (6 graduates since implementation in Fall 2012) Pellissippi State proposes to terminate the program due to limited enrollment prospects.</li> </ul>			

**Appendix A**  
**2016 Program Activity Report: New Academic Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
1	East Tennessee	Human Services	Master's
2	East Tennessee	Sport Science and Coach Education	Master's
3	Middle Tennessee	Religious Studies	Bachelor
4	Tennessee Tech & East Tennessee	Engineering	Bachelor
5	Cleveland	Welding Technology	Certificate
6	Columbia	Computer Networking	Certificate
7	Columbia	Web Design and Mobile Technologies	Certificate
8	Columbia	Hospitality & Tourism Management	Associate
9	Columbia	Medical Lab Technology	Associate
10	Jackson	Healthcare Technician	Certificate
11	Motlow	Medical Laboratory Technology	Associate
12	Nashville	Mechatronics	Associate
13	Northeast	Aviation Technology	Associate
14	Pellissippi	Scriptwriting	Certificate
15	Roane	Welding	Certificate
16	Roane	Computer Info Technology	Associate
17	Southwest	Advanced Machining	Certificate
18	Southwest	Industrial Motion Control Technology	Certificate
19	Southwest	Machining Fundamentals	Certificate
20	Southwest	PC and Networking Technician	Certificate
21	Volunteer	Mechatronics	Certificate
22	Volunteer	Mechatronics	Associate
23	Walters	Emergency Medical Services	Associate
24	Walters	Fire Science	Associate

**2016 Program Activity Report: Modified Academic Programs**

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
1	Austin Peay	Computer Info Technology	Bachelor
2	Austin Peay	Computer Information Systems	Bachelor
3	Austin Peay	Computer Science	Bachelor
4	Austin Peay	Health Care Administration	Master's
5	East Tennessee	Nutrition	Bachelor
6	East Tennessee	Cardiopulmonary Science	Bachelor
7	East Tennessee	Radiologic Science	Bachelor
8	East Tennessee	Reading	Master's
9	Middle Tennessee	Animation	Bachelor
10	Middle Tennessee	Journalism	Bachelor
11	Univ of Memphis	Advertising	Bachelor

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
12	Univ of Memphis	Public Relations	Bachelor
13	Univ of Memphis	Information Systems	Master's
14	Univ of Memphis	Sport Commerce	Master's
15	UT Chattanooga	Learning and Leadership, PhD (added)	Doctoral

### 2016 Program Activity: Terminated Academic Programs

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
1	Austin Peay	Professional Studies	Bachelor
2	Austin Peay	Advanced Teaching and Learning	Master's
3	East Tennessee	Kinesiology and Sports Studies	Master's
4	Univ of Memphis	Advanced Studies in Teaching and Learning	Master's
5	UT Health Science	Physical Therapy	Master's
6	UT Health Science	Anatomy	Doctoral
7	UT Health Science	Biochemistry	Doctoral
8	UT Health Science	Pathology	Doctoral
9	UT Health Science	Pharmacology	Doctoral
10	UT Health Science	Physical Therapy Science	Doctoral
11	UT Knoxville	Polymer Engineering	Master's
12	UT Knoxville	Polymer Engineering	Doctoral
13	Chattanooga	Basic Tax Accounting	Certificate
14	Chattanooga	International Business	Certificate
15	Chattanooga	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
16	Chattanooga	Web Technology	Associate
17	Cleveland	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
18	Cleveland	Teaching	Associate
19	Cleveland	Web Technology	Associate
20	Columbia	Basic Early Childhood Education	Certificate
21	Columbia	General Education Core	Certificate
22	Columbia	Pre-Allied Health	Certificate
23	Columbia	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
24	Columbia	Early Childhood Education	Associate
25	Columbia	Web Technology	Associate
26	Dyersburg	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
27	Dyersburg	Criminal Justice	Associate
28	Dyersburg	Fine Arts	Associate
29	Dyersburg	Medical Informatics	Associate
30	Dyersburg	Professional Studies	Associate
31	Dyersburg	Web Technology	Associate
32	Motlow	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
33	Motlow	Professional Studies	Associate
34	Motlow	Web Technology	Associate
35	Nashville	Drafting and Construction	Certificate
36	Nashville	Horticulture and Landscape Gardening	Certificate
37	Nashville	Computer Network Technology	Associate

	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Academic Program</b>	<b>Degree Level</b>
38	Nashville	Computer Technology	Associate
39	Nashville	Medical Informatics	Associate
40	Nashville	Professional Studies	Associate
41	Northeast	Public Safety and Justice Affairs	Associate
42	Pellissippi	Architectural AutoCAD Applications	Certificate
43	Pellissippi	Digital Imaging for Photography	Certificate
44	Pellissippi	Document Specialist	Certificate
45	Pellissippi	General Education Core	Certificate
46	Pellissippi	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
47	Pellissippi	Professional Studies	Associate
48	Pellissippi	Web Technology	Associate
49	Roane	Web Page Authoring	Certificate
50	Roane	Criminal Justice	Associate
51	Roane	Professional Studies	Associate
52	Roane	Web Technology	Associate
53	Walters	Information Technology	Associate