



MINUTES
SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS RECOMMENDATION COMMITTEE
JANUARY 27, 2017

The Standards Recommendation Committee met for its fifth scheduled meeting at Legislative Plaza at 9:00 am CST.

Present.....10

Absent.....0

Mr. David Barrett

Ms. Pamela Bobo

Mr. Bill Carey

Mr. William Freddy Curtis – Vice Chair

Dr. Shannon Duncan

Mr. Louis Gallo

Ms. Katherine Petko

Ms. Marsha Rains

Mr. Jason Roach – Chair

Mr. Todd Wigginton

9:20 am

Mr. Jason Roach called the meeting to order.

ACTION: **Mr. Roach** asked for a motion to adopt the day's agenda. **Mr. Bill Carey** moved acceptance. **Dr. Shannon Duncan** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Roach welcomed everyone back and said he hopes to make up some time, since the meeting is running behind.

ACTION: **Mr. Roach** asked for a motion to accept the January 13, 2017 minutes. **Mr. Freddy Curtis** moved acceptance. **Ms. Pamela Bobo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

9:25 am

Mr. Roach recapped the last meeting, stating that they are picking up this meeting on 3rd grade with the Tennessee history portion of the course. The committee resumed reviewing the proposal made by **Ms. Kenecia Sullivan**, the K-5 committee lead. **Mr. Roach** opened the floor for discussion.

3rd Grade (continued)

ACTION: **Ms. Marsha Rains** motioned to adopt the “Tennessee History: Indigenous Peoples and European Explorers” (standards 3.06 to 3.09, plus one) section of **Ms. Sullivan’s** proposal. **Dr. Duncan** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt the “Tennessee History: Early Settlements” (standards 3.10 to 3.14) section of **Ms. Sullivan’s** proposal. **Dr. Duncan** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Rains liked the revisions in this section. **Mr. Carey** had a question regarding Fort Loudoun in standard 3.12. **Mr. Dave Barrett** suggested including information clarifying that this is the first settlement. **Mr. Carey** was concerned why students would study Fort Loudoun if they have not learned about the French and Indian War.

Dr. Duncan explained that the wording of these standards is revised in the proposal for developmental appropriateness, instead of moving the standards to 4th grade. **Mr. Curtis** discussed having the Proclamation of 1763 as appropriate for 4th grade. The committee asked **Ms. Sullivan** for her opinion on the standard.

Ms. Sullivan said her team felt it was important that students hear these names so they can connect them to bigger ideas later on. **Ms. Sullivan** asked **Dr. Duncan** if there was something else she’d like to name, re: the settlements. **Mr. Barrett** wondered what the committee wanted students to know, if they keep standard 3.12. **Ms. Rains** said they want students to know about how life is developing, and **Mr. Barrett** and **Dr. Duncan** replied that that is covered in standard 3.11. **Ms. Sullivan** asked if the standard can give teachers a starting point to draw on Fort Loudoun being in Tennessee.

Mr. Todd Wigginton noted that Fort Loudoun signified peaceful coexistence as well as conflict. **Dr. Duncan** suggested new wording in combining the two standards (3.11 and 3.12).

Ms. Bobo had an issue with the word “frontier”; she explained that Fort Loudoun was used for something other than its initial intended purpose. She said she does not see the importance of 3.11.

Mr. Carey proposed a new standard he wrote (originally intended for 4th grade, but that might work for 3rd). He said it’s important to mention the names of tribes; others noted that they are listed in 3.07. **Mr. Carey** reiterated that Fort Loudoun should be taught in the context of the French and Indian War. **Mr. Carey** was still concerned about this section.

Dr. Duncan mentioned that using “Discuss the obstacles” might be better for this story-mode of 3rd grade. **Ms. Katherine Petko** asked if students in 8th grade might get more details on the Donelson story. **Dr. Duncan** tried to allay **Mr. Carey’s** concern that there isn’t enough geography, since the committee has added more in K-2.

ACTION: As an amendment to the previous motion, **Ms. Rains** proposed removal of standard 3.12 from the standards. **Mr. Barrett** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Rains** motioned to add a new standard 3.12: “Examine the fluctuating relationship between the American Indians and the settlers,” as pulled from **Mr. Carey’s** proposal. **Mr. Wigginton** seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

The committee worked to rewrite some of the wording for the standard. **Ms. Rains** and **Mr. Carey** collaborated to refine the standard to the committee's preferences. **Ms. Rains** asked if the language was too broad; **Dr. Duncan** noted that this comes soon after standard 3.07, which is detailed. **Mr. Wigginton** said he liked the word “evolving.” **Mr. Carey** said that word suggests things are getting better, which isn’t true here; things varied wildly. **Dr. Duncan** clarified that there are 4 definitions to “evolve,” one being to change or to grow, which could represent the ebb and flow of a relationship. **Mr. Wigginton** asked for **Ms. Sullivan’s** opinion; she suggested “fluctuating.” **Mr. Carey** agreed with that term.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to change the wording in standard 3.12 from “evolving” to “fluctuating”. **Mr. Curtis** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Dr. Duncan** motioned to change the wording in standard 3.14 from “explain” to “discuss.” **Mr. Curtis** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to adopt the section “Tennessee History: American Revolution and the Road to Statehood,” (standards 3.16 to 3.23) as proposed by **Ms. Sullivan**. **Ms. Rains** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Carey mentioned moving standards between 3rd and 4th grades. **Ms. Rains** likes students to know about their state in 3rd grade; she thinks they need to have a general, broad idea of how we got to the point of having a state. **Ms. Rains** said that at present, she pulls all the Tennessee history out and teaches it at a later time to teach as a story; she believes students need to be grounded in Tennessee history in 3rd grade before she can build on it. **Ms. Rains** said it can otherwise become jumbled and confusing for students to teach multiple levels of government at one time.

Dr. Duncan said she doesn’t disagree, but worried that since this is the first year students are assessed, these standards will fall at the end. **Dr. Duncan** was concerned that teachers will rush through this material and lose quality. **Ms. Rains** said that is already the case today, as is. **Mr. Carey** reminded the committee that they are removing 26 standards, but **Ms. Rains** countered that there is still a lot of content—very little is being removed. **Ms. Rains** said it could take 6 weeks to take 6 government standards, but she doesn’t have the time.

Mr. Curtis asked to hear **Ms. Sullivan’s** opinion on the section. **Ms. Sullivan** said she does the same thing that **Ms. Rains** does, in pulling out the Tennessee history to teach separately. **Ms. Sullivan** said it is very hard for students to learn multiple layers of government simultaneously. She said that standards 3.16 and 3.18 go hand in hand; students need to understand the four steps, nothing more in depth than that.

Mr. Carey said some people love the standards right now, but others say it’s tough to teach U.S. and Tennessee history at the same time. He says that, even so, here we teach 4 full years of U.S./Tennessee history, which is more than most states. Looking at the standard on the Lost State of Franklin, **Mr. Carey**

believes it should mention the Articles of Confederation; he said even then, kids don't know where Philadelphia is. **Dr. Duncan** noted that kids should have good map skills by this point, though. **Mr. Carey** doesn't want to add U.S. history to 3rd grade, though. **Dr. Duncan** said we need to keep this material together (either in 3rd or 4th grade).

Mr. Lou Gallo asked during what grades students will be assessed. He said there is a lot here and was worried there's too much content; maybe some content should be suggested rather than required. **Mr. Roach** brought up the supplemental document, which could be a great resource here. **Mr. Barrett** discussed that it's not realistic to assume that teachers will get through all the standards before April (when assessment is). He said there's usually a cutoff on what is assessable; it's not fair to assess something in April that is scheduled to be taught in May.

Ms. Rains mentioned the difference between school days and actual teaching time. She said she loses at least 30 days, and tries to map her standards over the course of 150 days; it's important to consider realistic, teachable content. **Mr. Barrett** said it's not that you can't get to it, it's that sequencing makes it so that it is later on.

Dr. Duncan asked for **Ms. Sullivan's** opinion. **Ms. Sullivan** asked if the committee meant that standards 3.16 and 3.17 is a lot of content right at the end. **Dr. Duncan** said it goes back to Bloom's Taxonomy and choosing the right words.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Dr. Duncan** motioned to change the wording of standard 3.16 to "Identify the Lost State of Franklin as Tennessee's first attempt at statehood and explain the reasons for the failure of the Lost State of Franklin." **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Wigginton wondered if it's possible to assess the word "discuss." **Dr. Duncan** said this is better because it's not too high-level for 3rd grade. **Ms. Sullivan** let the committee know that the Lost State of Franklin is taught more in 8th grade, along with the Territory South of the River Ohio; this material can be scaffolded down if it's too much. **Mr. Carey** stated that now they're getting rid of Tennessee history and teaching it only once. **Ms. Sullivan** said that this only pertains to two standards.

Dr. Duncan suggested just changing some of the standard words where the concept is introduced, but students are not expected to gain an in-depth knowledge. **Mr. Carey** said that 3rd grade is a world geography grade. **Dr. Duncan** said this way you can introduce early explorers and move into early settlements. **Mr. Carey** said Tennessee history belongs in 4th grade.

Mr. Wigginton struggled with the word "discuss." He thought "explain" was fine and more assessable. **Dr. Duncan** said "discuss" makes it less likely to be assessed. **Ms. Kadie Patterson** said if it is in the standards, it will still be assessed. She said, however, the word "discuss" does not lend itself well to assessments.

Ms. Petko reiterated that regardless of the verb, the content will be assessed. **Mr. Roach** said if it is specific, at least you know what is coming in the assessment. **Mr. Wigginton** said this should be low-level and basic. **Ms. Petko** asserted that a 3rd grader could give a 3rd grade level explanation.

ACTION: Following the preceding discussion, **Mr. Wigginton** proposed an amendment to change “discuss” to “explain” in 3.16. **Ms. Petko** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Rains** proposed adding a standard in the “Tennessee History: American Revolution and the Road to Statehood” section to include state government, with the directive that the educator committee write it. This motion failed due to a lack of second.

Dr. Duncan wondered what **Ms. Rains** specifically wanted to add. **Ms. Rains** said her students struggle to differentiate between the federal government versus state government. She wants students to have a basic idea of the differences. **Mr. Wigginton** and **Mr. Curtis** asked for **Ms. Sullivan**’s opinion. **Ms. Sullivan** said there was originally a standard, but that people didn’t like it. She said the committee could add the word “structure”, which **Ms. Rains** supported.

ACTION: **Mr. Wigginton** asked to revisit **Ms. Rains**’ previous motion for an amendment, to have the educator committee add a standard regarding the structure of Tennessee’s government. **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Rains explained in more detail what she wanted to be addressed in this standard. **Mr. Curtis** suggested modifying standard 3.23 to cover the branches of government and remove the president. **Ms. Rains** wished this standard could address elections, because voting could help student understanding.

Mr. Carey said it’s important to give parents an idea of what students will learn each year. He said it’s clear in K, 1st, 2nd, 4th, and 5th, but not 3rd grade—the course addresses a number of unrelated topics. He thinks that 3rd grade teachers won’t like it and that kids aren’t geniuses, even though it seems they can do a lot in 3rd grade. **Ms. Petko** agreed, as a parent of a 3rd grade student. She described the course as a potpourri of everything and stated that the committee is setting teachers/parents/students up for serious frustration.

Dr. Duncan said this could go in time-period context in 4th grade. **Mr. Carey** said the committee previously discussed this section, and he objected to adding more to 3rd grade. **Mr. Gallo** said he could picture his 8th grader memorizing these standards and having no conceptual understanding outside of a test. He said that he hates when kids come into history and think it is just memorization. **Mr. Gallo** was alarmed at the amount of testable material for 3rd grade.

ACTION: Following the preceding discussion, **Mr. Carey** motioned to move the entire “Tennessee History: American Revolution and the Road to Statehood” section to 4th grade (standards 3.16 to 3.23). **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion passed, with a 7-2 vote.

Ms. Petko said their subcommittee had discussed this change previously. She suggested that 4th grade begin with the Lost Colony of Roanoke. **Mr. Roach** noted that **Mr. Carey** didn’t have to explain exactly where these standards would begin, but that the educator committee could be charged with working on this.

Mr. Curtis asked to hear from **Ms. Sullivan**. **Ms. Sullivan** said that if you consider the original feedback, 4th grade only had about a 50% keep rate; reviewers said there was just too much content to do both U.S.

history and Tennessee history. Most of the feedback said that teaching both Tennessee and U.S. history at the same time was too much.

Ms. Petko said that if 4th grade teachers are concerned about that, maybe it would be possible for the committee to change it so that there is a unit on Tennessee at the beginning of 4th, then continue with U.S. history. **Ms. Sullivan** said 4th grade teachers didn't want to eliminate the Tennessee history content, they just wanted it moved to 3rd grade. **Ms. Petko** said that if it isn't embedded anyway, then just pull it out and make it a separate unit.

Mr. Barrett asked how many standards would be left in 3rd grade and how much would be added in 4th, if the committee moved these standards out of 3rd grade. He wondered if there is sufficient time to truly teach this content in depth so that students can be fairly assessed. **Mr. Barrett** said that with 36 standards, that leaves a reasonable number to teach per quarter. **Mr. Roach** mentioned that as **Mr. Carey** said at the last meeting, if the committee moves standards to 4th grade, but the committee still hasn't started with 4th grade, then they can always go back and revisit things.

Ms. Petko said that if this is done, then 3rd grade will have 29 standards and there will be 45 in 4th grade. **Mr. Carey** said that one of the 29 standards is to learn the 50 states and that some are more difficult than others. **Dr. Duncan** said the subcommittee's initial vision was to move this content into the context when it actually occurs.

Mr. Wigginton asked if this discussion could be revisited if the committee voted to move this section. **Mr. Carey** clarified that this vote could either move the section out of 3rd grade or into 4th grade.

Ms. Rains requested a point of information. She clarified with **Ms. Patterson** that if something is in a standard, then it can be tested. **Ms. Patterson** affirmed that and stated that anything in the standards can be included in the assessment. She said it is expected that students are taught all standards by the end of April.

Ms. Petko asked whether every example from phrases like "including" or "i.e." would be assessed. **Ms. Patterson** confirmed that they can be. **Mr. Carey** asked that the committee stop using "trump" as a verb. **Mr. Roach** noted that **Mr. Carey** made a joke and everyone laughed.

Mr. Wigginton suggested that **Ms. Sullivan** move closer to the committee. **Mr. Wigginton** appreciated that in the last motion, nothing was set in stone and it can be revisited. He said because the committee had voted on so much, he was having a hard time following the flow. He noted that the revised standards had an 80% keep rate and asked the committee to tread carefully in changes at the risk of ignoring the public feedback and educator committee. **Ms. Duncan** said that 3rd grade had the highest revised rate, and **Ms. Sullivan** noted that it was still 71-72% keep rate.

Mr. Roach reminded the committee that they do not have to get extremely specific in their recommendations, but can defer to the educator committee for revisions as well.

Dr. Duncan asked whether **Ms. Sullivan** had any recommendations for 4th grade. **Ms. Sullivan** said no, that 4th grade had a very high keep rate. **Dr. Duncan** had a question about the early explorers and asked

what happened to the remainder of standard 4.02. **Ms. Sullivan** said it's important to have that as a lead in—Columbus has to arrive first before any other explorers are introduced.

Dr. Duncan gave a summary of where the early grades subcommittee left off; they moved standards 4.01 and 4.02 to 3rd grade and moved the section on “Tennessee History: American Revolution and the Road to Statehood” to 4th grade. Standard 4.03 was an introduction to early exploration. **Ms. Petko** clarified with **Dr. Duncan** where the group decided to move standard 4.02.

Ms. Sullivan said that there are a few suggestions for revisions to 4th and 5th grade, but they are not as major as the proposals for 3rd. The committee found copies of **Ms. Sullivan's** suggestions among their materials. **Ms. Rains** said she was generally in agreement with **Ms. Sullivan's** suggestions.

10:30 am

The committee took a break.

4th Grade

10:45 am

ACTION: **Ms. Petko** motioned to delete 4.01 from 4th grade (and move content to 3rd grade). **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Carey brought attention to standard 4.03. He believes that the Colombian Exchange is above a 4th grade level and would like to pull it out—it is a deep and controversial concept that should probably be covered in AP European History. **Mr. Gallo** asked if this is taught in 8th grade. **Ms. Blair Lynch** responded that it is addressed in 8th grade, with triangular trade—but they do not use the phrase “Colombian Exchange”. **Mr. Roach** asked what the keep percentage on this standard was. **Mr. Carey** said it was 94% keep.

ACTION: Following the preceding discussion, **Mr. Carey** motioned to remove standard 4.03. **Mr. Curtis** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: **Ms. Petko** motioned to remove standard 4.02 from 4th grade and move it to the 3rd grade, upon suggestion from **Ms. Sullivan**. This would replace/combine the content with standard 3.08 as “Describe the routes and contributions of early explorers” and also add Magellan and Vespucci to the standard. **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Barrett asked to review standard 3.08 to see what is being moved and revised. Magellan and Vespucci were added to the standard.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Dr. Duncan** motioned to change the lead-in on standard 3.08 to address “routes and contributions”. **Mr. Gallo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

11:30 am

ACTION: **Dr. Duncan** motioned to move the section “Tennessee History: Early Settlements” (standards 3.10 to 3.14) to proceed “Tennessee History: American Revolution and the Road to Statehood” (standards 3.16 to 3.23), which the committee previously moved to 4th grade. **Ms. Petko** seconded. The motion failed with a 5-5 vote, after the committee held a deep discussion about the 3rd and 4th grade Tennessee history content.

Dr. Duncan explained to **Ms. Bobo** her intention for making the revision. **Mr. Carey** said it seemed that timeline wise, this might not make sense. **Dr. Duncan** said the original motion was just to move the section as a chunk, but could be refined later.

Mr. Wigginton asked for **Ms. Sullivan**’s thoughts. **Ms. Sullivan** noted that the committee doesn’t seem to be taking the initial feedback into account here; the 4th grade keep rate went from about 50% keep to 80% when the committee’s changes were made and Tennessee History was moved to 3rd grade, and now the SRC is proposing going back. **Dr. Duncan** said that it is just one source of feedback; she sat down with groups of teachers and they liked the ending point of early explorers in 8th grade.

Mr. Carey suggested that there are many reasons for the increase in keep rate. **Ms. Sullivan** explained that if you take it standard by standard, individuals can only vote on if they do or do not want a standard in 4th grade; 4th grade had a very low keep rate because of those standards. **Ms. Sullivan** stated that is why the committee moved them to 3rd, because of feedback and their professional opinion. **Ms. Petko** said that it is a block of standards/time though, so they would be moved together.

Mr. Carey said that based on the numbers, the least popular standard was on Marquis de Lafayette and another regarding writing an opinion piece. **Mr. Carey** said the standards before had ridiculous detail that teachers had to get into and that teachers would love a 4th grade Tennessee history class, but it doesn’t seem to be in the cards. **Mr. Carey** stated that the Governor and General Assembly want the committee to embed.

Ms. Sullivan explained why the keep rates were so low, after looking at the comments. **Ms. Sullivan** stated that students cannot marry two different pieces of Tennessee and U.S. history—it’s too much for kids to comprehend. **Mr. Carey** wondered why we couldn’t do Tennessee history in 4th grade. **Ms. Sullivan** said that it’s because US history is 4th and 5th grade. **Mr. Carey** said the committee could just do U.S. history in 8th and 11th grade, like other states.

Mr. Barrett clarified the motion and asked if the educator committee could maybe come back with a proposal on this. **Dr. Duncan** asked **Ms. Sullivan** if she had made any proposed suggestions for the 3rd grade standards in question here. **Dr. Duncan** explained that when the subcommittee discussed moving these to 8th grade, they were looking at the original draft (not the proposed suggestions).

Ms. Rains asked the committee if she is correct in that the changes the committee proposed are going full circle to be (minus curriculum) the exact same as the standards she is currently required to teach. **Ms. Patterson** showed on the screen what 4th grade will include, based on the committee’s votes. **Mr. Carey** disagreed with **Ms. Rains** and said that there are many fewer standards and primary sources. **Ms.**

Patterson clarified that the standards in discussion were removed by the teacher committee and put in 3rd grade (based on the initial feedback) and the SRC was now moving them back to 4th grade.

Mr. Gallo noted that with elementary school teacher explanations, it seems that either 3rd or 4th grade will feel like they have too much. **Mr. Gallo** wondered if Tennessee history could be reconsidered as a course in middle school and that way it could get focus without overwhelming any elementary grade.

Dr. Duncan said that part of why she made this motion is because there were random chunks at the beginning of the 3rd and 4th grades. **Ms. Sullivan** said that she would prefer that the “Road to Statehood” section stay in 3rd grade. She doesn’t think it’s too much to ask students to do that work. **Ms. Sullivan** did propose that the committee look at standards 3.16 and 3.17, to scaffold them down or leave them to go deeper for 8th grade. In her professional opinion, she thought that the content is not too much for a 3rd grader.

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt the entire section “Settling the Thirteen Colonies” (standards 4.04 to 4.13). **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to change standard 4.04 to “Summarize the failure of the lost colony of Roanoke and the survival of the colony at Jamestown.” **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion failed on a 1-8 vote.

Ms. Rains said she is concerned because these are two very different colonies and discussions. **Ms. Petko** recalled that Jamestown is in its own standard in 8th grade. **Ms. Rains** felt strongly that Jamestown be included in 4th grade, since it was the first successful colony. **Ms. Lynch** said in 8th grade they do thoroughly cover Jamestown, although students have not always heard about it before.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Gallo** motioned to change standard 4.04 to address theories of the Lost Colony of Roanoke. **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion did not go to a vote; **Mr. Gallo** rescinded the motion, in deference to the next motion proposed.

Mr. Wigginton expressed concern with the word “discuss” in standard 4.04.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Petko** motioned to change the language in standard 4.04 from “discuss” to “describe”. **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Rains** motioned to add a standard immediately after 4.04 that reads “Explain the significance of the settlement of Jamestown and explain the role it played in settling our country.” **Mr. Carey** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Curtis asked if maybe it makes more sense to add that standard between standards 4.08 and 4.09. **Ms. Rains** said she thinks it makes sense to have Jamestown before other events.

Ms. Petko asked **Ms. Sullivan** about her revisions for standards 4.06 and 4.10.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Petko** motioned to adopt **Ms. Sullivan’s** revisions for standards 4.06 and 4.10. [4.06 Describe the early competition between European nations for control

of North America, and identify the colonization efforts of the British, French, and Spanish; 4.10 Identify representative assemblies and town meetings as early democratic practices during the colonial period.] **Mr. Gallo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Wigginton asked to change the verb to “explain.” **Mr. Gallo** thought that “describe” was good and argued that “explain” would be too in-depth for European history.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Rains** motioned to add or modify a standard similar in wording to the Jamestown standard about the Massachusetts Bay Colony and Plymouth, with the teacher review committee asked to craft or revise a standard. **Mr. Gallo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to change standard 4.11 to include “...and Catholicism in Maryland.” **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

12:15 pm

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Barrett** motioned to send standard 4.08 to the teacher committee for rewording of terminology “indentured servitude” and “slavery”. (Possible changes: Identify the reasons for founding of the thirteen colonies, including: economic and political incentives, and religious freedom; and the role of indentured servitude and slavery in the settlement of the colonies.) **Mr. Carey** seconded. The motion passed unanimously, following the discussion below.

Mr. Barrett said that in the standard it sounds like indentured servitude and slavery are reasons for the founding. **Mr. Gallo** suggested changing the standard to “identify the reasons....” **Mr. Barrett** asked to add a semi-colon to make it clearer. **Ms. Sullivan** noted that if there is a semi-colon, they may need to add another verb. **Mr. Barrett** said that he would like to send the standard to the educator committee for revision.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Barrett** motioned to send standard 4.13 back to the educator committee to reword “...that led to the defeat of the American Indians.” **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Carey discussed how there is something in Tennessee history that he wants included in this section of 4th grade.

12:35 pm

The committee took a break for lunch.

1:25 pm

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** proposed adding a new standard (after standard 3.17): “Explain the significance of the Nickajack Expedition against the Chickamaugas and Dragging Canoe.” **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion failed on a 2-7 vote, following the discussion below.

Mr. Carey was concerned that this information is missing from the standards. He noted that Dragging Canoe isn't mentioned at all, and Nickajack is Tennessee's Wounded Knee. He believes it is an essential event that provides the history of American Indians; there's a huge missing part between statehood and the American Indian movement.

Ms. Petko asked if this is 4th grade level or more 8th grade level; she wonders if teachers will bring it up. **Mr. Carey** responded that teachers like this and that it involves numerous parts of the state. In some ways, he says it is more important than legends like Nancy Ward—this was a really big turning point.

Ms. Rains asked what year the Nickajack Expedition took place; **Mr. Carey** said 1793. **Ms. Rains** noted that it doesn't fall into this time period. **Mr. Carey** stated that he would want this at the end of the Tennessee section the committee already voted to add in (in "Road to Statehood"); this would be after the draft standard 3.17. **Mr. Carey** also mentioned the Treaty of Holston, explaining that this was a result of the treaty's failure.

Ms. Rains asked **Ms. Lynch** whether this content is covered in 8th grade. **Ms. Lynch** said that it is covered—Dragging Canoe is part of their standards, included with Daniel Boone and the Cumberland Gap. **Ms. Rains** asked if **Ms. Lynch** thinks this is developmentally appropriate for 4th graders or 8th graders. **Ms. Lynch** said it would definitely fit well in 8th grade, with their background knowledge.

Mr. Carey explained that Nancy Ward knew Dragging Canoe, and Nancy Ward was taught in 3rd grade; he said it can refer back to that. **Ms. Rains** said she liked the content in 8th grade. **Mr. Roach** asked **Ms. Rains** about Jamestown; **Ms. Rains** said that some of the violence and details regarding Jamestown might be too much for 4th graders. **Mr. Carey** stated that the U.S. government has never recognized that the Nickajack Expedition happened, and **Ms. Rains** said that's why it should probably go into 8th grade.

Mr. Roach summarized the discussion by asking the committee if they supported adding **Mr. Carey's** standard as written, or adding in the concepts scaffolded more developmentally-appropriately. **Dr. Duncan** said that those types of details were things she learned in her college history class; she thinks it is beyond 4th grade. **Mr. Carey** said it's important for kids to know the hell that these people went through and their horrible experiences. He said we're implying that people in Jamestown had a hard time but people in Tennessee didn't.

The committee worked to wordsmith the standard to make it more appropriate. **Ms. Rains** expressed numerous reservations about the potential standard. **Mr. Barrett** said he doesn't think that 4th graders should have to know this by the end of the year.

1:50 pm

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt the entire "The War for Independence" section (standards 4.14 to 4.23). **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Sullivan explained to the SRC that she incorporated public feedback to reduce the details in this section.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to accept **Ms. Sullivan's** revisions to standard 4.22 ("Examine the major events and battles of the American Revolution..."). **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add the Battle of King's Mountain to standard 4.22. **Mr. Gallo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously, following the explanation below.

Mr. Carey said it was a turnaround in the American Revolution and very important in East Tennessee.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to replace Mercy Otis Warren with Betsy Ross in standard 4.23. **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously, following the discussion below.

Mr. Carey said that he is not trying to pick on Mercy Otis Warren, but he wants to keep the fun in the class. He mentioned that Dr. Van West had questions about why Betsy Ross wasn't included. **Ms. Rains** inquired why the committee chose these specific ladies. **Ms. Sullivan** was not opposed to replacing Warren with Betsy Ross. **Ms. Rains** was concerned that Betsy Ross is part legend, part reality, while the others are absolutes.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Barrett** motioned to send standard 4.20 back to the educator committee for revision (suggestions include: 1) add other groups besides slavery, i.e., women, American Indians; 2) treatment of different groups at the time, including: slaves, women, and American Indians). **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously, following the discussion below.

Mr. Barrett said this standard is not terribly clear and that he doesn't know where they're going with that item. **Mr. Wigginton** said the question is around the phrase "all men are created equal." **Ms. Rains** noted that Thomas Jefferson said that while he also owned slaves and said that it's gray when you teach it. **Mr. Barrett** explained that if you say men...it brings up the question, are men and women created equal? He said you can get into the mindset of 16th and 17th centuries. **Ms. Rains** said that we have to get into that area because everything is written as 'male'.

Ms. Sullivan said that students understand the difference. **Ms. Petko** asked if maybe the committee could say equality rather than specify a gender or group of people. **Mr. Barrett** wondered what the Declaration of Independence calls for. **Ms. Sullivan** said that students would be discussing all of it, including that there was only equality for white men at the time the Declaration was created. **Ms. Rains** expounded upon this statement, saying that you have to set the stage for slavery and freedom for England.

Mr. Barrett noted that if you just mentioned the existence of slavery (and not other folks that aren't equal), it's not worded properly to address that. He wondered how it would be assessed. **Ms. Rains** suggested adding in other types of inequality. **Mr. Barrett** concurred, mentioning property owners, leadership positions, or religion.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add Fort Loudoun to standard 4.15, changing it to "Analyze the causes and consequences of the French and Indian War and recognize

Fort Loudoun's role in it." **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously, following the discussion below.

Mr. Carey said that in 3rd grade, Fort Loudoun got deleted with the idea of bringing it to 4th grade. He said it was in standard 3.12 (which was deleted to bring back to 4th grade). The committee discussed that the Proclamation of 1763 was removed in 3rd grade but is still in 4th grade. **Mr. Wigginton** asked to see the whole standard. He wondered if they are asking students to recognize Fort Loudoun's role or understand something more.

ACTION: Mr. Barrett motioned to change the formatting of "join or die". The motion was rescinded, since this type of edit does not require a vote.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add "aka Tories" as a synonym for Loyalists in standard 4.21 (per the recommendation of Dr. Van West). **Mr. Curtis** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add a mention of the "writings of Thomas Paine and Patrick Henry" into standard 4.16. **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Sullivan noted that the writings of Thomas Paine and Patrick Henry are not at a 4th grade level. Also, she said that the standard looks more into the acts rather than people. **Dr. Duncan** said that she uses those speeches and writing in high school literature. She reminded the committee that they should consider that what students write is assessed, and it is scary that it's a possible assessment for a 4th grader.

Ms. Rains said that, here, a laundry list would get even longer for students to know; she noted that even if it's scaffolded down to be basic, it can be too much. **Ms. Sullivan** also stated that in teaching this standard, they don't know which writing could be selected for the assessment. **Ms. Petko** suggested putting this into the supplemental document.

Mr. Roach asked about the role of Thomas Paine and Patrick Henry, rather than their writings. **Mr. Carey** rhetorically asked if *Common Sense* is the best-selling pamphlet in American history. **Ms. Petko** said that in standard 4.29, there is a list of people that could address Paine and Henry and leave standard 4.16 as political ideas. **Ms. Rains** said that would allow for an appropriate developmental level.

Mr. Wigginton asked if they still need the list in standard 4.16. **Ms. Sullivan** said that at least some of it is needed, but not necessarily all. **Ms. Rains** said that helps drive the discussion on what students are responsible for.

Mr. Gallo said a 4th grade student analyzing Paine or Henry is inappropriate. **Dr. Duncan** noted that it's important to introduce the ideas and plant the roots to set the stage for learning more about the speeches later on. **Ms. Rains** was concerned with adding more people and said it can become cumbersome.

Mr. Carey read aloud the current list of ten people in the standards. **Mr. Gallo** argued that Paine is more important at the 4th grade level, with the caveat that he doesn't teach elementary school. **Mr. Wigginton** thought that the quote "give me liberty or give me death" could be something kids could latch on to.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned for standard 4.16 to instead discuss the role of Thomas Paine and Patrick Henry. **Ms. Bobo** seconded. Following the preceding discussion, the motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned for standard 4.16 to instead discuss the role of Patrick Henry. **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. Following the preceding discussion, the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Barrett asked if 4th graders had gotten to fractions yet. **Ms. Rains** said they definitely have.

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt the “Creating a New Government” section (standards 4.24 to 4.27). **Ms. Petko** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to adopt the “Building the New Nation” section (standards 4.28 to 4.34). **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Petko asked if standard 4.31 is too much for 4th graders; **Ms. Sullivan** said yes, it is way too much. **Ms. Sullivan** explained how the committee worked to reduce the list. **Ms. Petko** was confused on if the recommendation is to keep or remove trade. **Ms. Sullivan** said she is not passionate either way on including it. **Mr. Curtis** noted that William Henry Harrison and Tecumseh are in 8th grade.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to adopt **Ms. Sullivan’s** proposed revision for standard 4.31. **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add a standard between 4.30 and 4.31 that says “Describe how west Tennessee’s image was shaped by the New Madrid Earthquakes of 1811-12.” **Mr. Gallo** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion failed with a 1-8 vote.

Mr. Gallo noted that New Madrid Earthquakes are already in the 8th grade standards. **Ms. Sullivan** said they took it out of 4th grade for that reason. **Ms. Petko** wondered if it’s better placed in 8th grade. **Ms. Rains** said that students will have a better idea of the scientific and geographical side of the earthquakes once they’re older.

Ms. Sullivan noted that students study more on earthquakes beginning in 5th grade. **Mr. Carey** pointed out that if they are trying to embed Tennessee history, then there isn’t much included in this section. **Mr. Carey** highlighted a number of Tennessee history facts no longer included in the 4th grade standards.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Gallo** motioned to revise standard 4.33 and remove “the corrupt bargain.” **Mr. Barrett** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Gallo said there are already so many bullets; this is one that is not necessary and can be removed.

Ms. Rains wondered aloud if there should be more taught on Andrew Jackson to students in 4th grade. **Ms. Petko** suggested leaving it to the teacher’s discretion. **Mr. Carey** noted that Jackson was the first

congressman from Tennessee. **Ms. Petko** said she's still not sure if it's essential information or if it's just trivia.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Bobo** motioned to move standard 4.34 to "The Growth of a Republic" section. **Mr. Carey** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Bobo said that this standard is out of order. **Ms. Rains** asked if that impacts standard 4.33, and **Ms. Bobo** said yes (but that she only wanted to do one motion at a time).

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add a standard between 4.31 and 4.32 that says "Explain the Chickasaw Purchase of 1818 and how it became part of Tennessee." **Ms. Bobo** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed with a 6-3 vote.

Mr. Carey said that 1/3 of the state was purchased by the government during Andrew Jackson's presidency. He noted that it is in the current standards and did not believe it was unpopular. **Ms. Petko** asked if this is in 8th grade, and **Ms. Lynch** said no. **Ms. Patterson** said that this is in current standard 4.53.

Ms. Petko said she sees the merit in that it's state history, but she's not sure it is essential. **Mr. Curtis** asked if perhaps it was instead added in 8th grade. **Mr. Carey** said he didn't see why it couldn't be in both courses. **Mr. Carey** expressed not wanting West Tennessee left out. **Mr. Barrett** said he feels completely empowered as a West Tennessean and wondered if this is trivia.

Ms. Bobo disagreed and said that it's important to explain how the borders of the state were determined. **Ms. Rains** agreed with **Ms. Bobo**, but was curious whether a 9 or 10 year old would appreciate ever-evolving maps like that; she struggles with how to make this meaningful. **Mr. Carey** responded to this content being called "trivia"; he doesn't know if it is, but wants kids to have complete knowledge.

Mr. Barrett said that this is U.S. history, and **Mr. Carey** disagreed, saying this is U.S. and Tennessee history. **Mr. Barrett** referenced the title of 4th grade, that says it's U.S. history. **Mr. Carey** suggested telling the general public that they aren't doing Tennessee history. **Mr. Carey** explained that there is no 'chunk' of Tennessee in 4th grade. **Dr. Duncan** described that thus far, they've stairstepped Tennessee history and done things in chunks—she asked whether they want to keep that approach or, now that they're in legit U.S. history mode, instead make content be interwoven.

Mr. Roach said he personally likes teaching U.S. history with Tennessee history embedded. He was not concerned about folding this in, but understanding too that developmental appropriateness is important. **Mr. Wigginton** stated that in elementary school many of these teachers don't have history degrees, let alone a background in Tennessee history.

Mr. Carey voiced concern that there is no mention of where west Tennessee came from or how Nashville became the capital; he didn't feel like the SRC was making attempts to embed. **Ms. Petko** recalled that by this point, 4th graders have studied the grand divisions and this would add to the history part.

Ms. Rains asked if maybe now they have a module to recap what has happened to this point. **Ms. Petko** expressed confusion because she thought that the educator committee would be putting the 4th grade

standards in a logical order (“Road to Statehood” section). **Ms. Sullivan** reminded the committee that this is what is currently being taught in isolation and would be difficult to integrate.

Mr. Wigginton reminded the SRC that the educator committee has heard them—they have professional expertise and have gotten their colleagues’ opinions as well. He recommended sending the 4th grade standards back to the educator committee to allow **Ms. Sullivan** to bring back a proposal to the SRC.

ACTION: **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to allow the educator committee to review the Tennessee history standards in 3rd & 4th grades by looking at the flow of Tennessee-specific information imbedded and/or as standalone modules of Tennessee history. **Mr. Curtis** seconded. The motion passed with an 8-1 vote.

Ms. Rains said that she appreciates this process and its transparency. She wants the committee to take their time and make sure that this is thorough. **Mr. Carey** would like to explore the possibility of adding either a 3rd or 4th grade Tennessee history class.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to ask the educator committee to recognize that a standalone Tennessee history class is still an option and to review having a separate course in grades K-5. **Ms. Petko** seconded. The motion passed with an 8-1 vote.

Mr. Carey asked about when the committee would do these revisions if the next meeting is in 2 weeks. **Ms. Laura Encalade** responded that the revisions may not be brought back at the next meeting, but at a meeting in late March to finalize the recommendations.

Dr. Duncan inquired with **Ms. Sullivan** if there is the possibility for discussion on how much content can be included in limited time, particularly if there is a standalone Tennessee history course. **Mr. Carey** pointed out that they are sending this back to the educator committee, when the educator committee had sent it to the SRC.

Ms. Petko acknowledged that they brought a proposal that the SRC has deliberated all day. **Mr. Carey** wondered why they’d do anything differ than what they’ve already offered. **Dr. Duncan** said that in her experience with math & ELA, the SRC sent recommendations to the committee and the proposals they brought back were different. **Ms. Rains** liked that they are sending these standards back to practitioners.

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt “The Growth of the Republic” section (standards 4.35 to 4.42). **Mr. Carey** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add a standard between 4.35 and 4.36 on Nashville’s selection as state capital. The motion failed without a second.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Wigginton** motioned to strike “Davey” from David Crockett’s name in standard 4.39. **Ms. Rains** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Petko** motioned to accept Ms. Sullivan’s proposed revisions for standards 4.38 and 4.41. **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Barrett** motioned to send standard 4.37 back to the educator committee to revisit the wording and scope of standard (“on plantations and other farms” “slave life across the south” “small farms and plantations”). **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

The committee discussed slavery and slave life in Tennessee. **Ms. Sullivan** noted that this is an extension of standard 4.36, with an expansion on the plantation system. **Mr. Barrett** explained the broad spectrum of experiences encountered by those held in slavery; he thought it would be good to be able to explore all of those, not just plantations.

5th Grade

ACTION: **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt “The United States Before the Civil War” section (standards 5.01 to 5.06). **Mr. Gallo** seconded. The motion passed with an 8-1 vote.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Barrett** motioned to send standard 5.05 to the educator committee to look at reordering wording (including states’ rights and slavery) of the standard. **Ms. Bobo** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Carey wondered why the standard couldn’t just be cut off.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Ms. Rains** motioned to adopt **Ms. Sullivan’s** proposed revision to standard 5.04 (Compare and contrast the various sectional stances on states’ rights and slavery represented by the presidential candidates in the election of 1860, including Abraham Lincoln and Stephen A. Douglas.) **Mr. Wigginton** seconded. The motion passed with an 8-1 vote.

Mr. Curtis and **Ms. Petko** wanted to keep all the names in standard 5.04. **Mr. Carey** suggested it made sense to either remove all four or keep all four—keeping two doesn’t make sense. **Ms. Rains** said that this is confusing for her kids and this revision simplifies things for this age group. **Ms. Rains** like **Ms. Petko’s** idea of possibly adding more people in teaching the content, but not requiring them in the standards.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to revise standard 5.01, removing the term “antebellum south” and replacing it with “slavery” and changing the standard’s stem to include “north and antebellum south”. **Mr. Gallo** seconded. Following the discussion below, the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Carey said that “antebellum south” makes no sense in this context. **Ms. Sullivan** said that the committee looked at sectional differences. **Mr. Wigginton** liked the word antebellum being used, so students have exposure to that vocabulary. **Mr. Carey** reiterated that 25% of people who lived in Tennessee were slaves; he suggested saying “antebellum north and south” instead. **Mr. Gallo** believed that slavery is enough of an issue that it has to be addressed; he said there are enough other economic differences to list that separately.

Mr. Carey brought up an unrelated question about primary sources; he remembers discussion of an appendix or supplemental document that contains these sources. **Ms. Patterson** said that there is only a

very rough draft so far; she explained that this is TDOE-created because it is not directly part of the standards. **Mr. Wigginton** said that Dr. Van West volunteered to help create these documents.

Ms. Patterson reminded the committee that there are limitations to the document—everything must be open source in the public domain and free. **Mr. Carey** clarified that there can be no primary source in an appendix that isn't in the public domain. **Ms. Patterson** confirmed this, saying that the standards cannot prescribe curriculum. **Ms. Petko** wondered if the supplemental document was optional, and **Ms. Patterson** said that is correct.

Mr. Wigginton noted that teachers would want to use that. **Ms. Petko** said that these sources have to be equitable. **Ms. Patterson** explained that this is in deference to local control and the state not dictating curriculum.

ACTION: As an amendment, **Mr. Carey** motioned to add a new standard between 5.01 and 5.03 on slave projects. The motion failed without a second.

ACTION: **Mr. Roach** asked for a motion to adjourn.
Ms. Rains moved to adjourn. **Dr. Duncan** seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting concluded.