MINUTES

SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS RECOMMENDATION COMMITTEE JANUARY 13, 2016

The Standards Recommendation Committee met for its third scheduled meeting at the Tennessee Higher Education Commission's board room at 9:00 CT.

Absent.....0

Present......10 Mr. David Barrett Dr. Pamela Bobo Mr. Bill Carey Mr. William Freddy Curtis – Vice Chair Dr. Shannon Duncan Mr. Louis Gallo Ms. Katherine Petko Ms. Marsha Rains Mr. Jason Roach - Chair Mr. Todd Wigginton

9:05 AM

Mr. Roach called the meeting to order. He welcomed everyone back.

ACTION:	 Mr. Roach asked for a motion to adopt today's agenda. Ms. Marsha Rains moved acceptance. Dr. Shannon Duncan seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
ACTION:	 Mr. Roach asked for a motion to accept November 17, 2016 minutes. Dr. Duncan moved acceptance. Ms. Katherine Petko seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

9:10 AM

Ms. Laura Encalade began her presentation on the entire public feedback from the draft social studies standards review website. The public review website ended on December 15, 2016. In three months, the website received over 53,000 reviews and 9,000 comments.

Mr. Freddy Curtis mentioned that only 10 people reviewed high school psychology so it skews the data a bit since there are not a large number of people who reviewed. **Ms. Encalade** encouraged the committee to look deeper into the data to see how many people did review each course.

Ms. Encalade continued the presentation on the public feedback. No committee members had questions.

9:30 AM

Mr. Roach welcomed **Mr. Carroll Van West**, Tennessee's state historian, to have a discussion with the Standards Recommendation Committee members.

Mr. West said that he wanted to share comments that people shared with him directly. He said that there is still some consensus among decision-makers that fourth grade should be all about Tennessee history, not integrated with US history. He said that he is largely here to emphasize only a few things. He thinks state history is vitally important for every community and for citizenship. It is important to learn from the past and value citizenship.

Mr. West passed out a one pager on a project that he has been working on with key themes that he believes should be part of the standards. He then discussed some major examples of what he thinks are key aspects of Tennessee history.

Mr. Roach thanked **Dr. West** for his comments and said that he believes everyone on the committee does love being Tennesseans. **Mr. Roach** also opened the floor to the committee to ask any questions to Dr. West.

Mr. Wigginton thanked **Mr. Roach** for the opportunity of bringing **Dr. West** into the conversation today. He asked **Dr. West** if he would be willing to help the committee create supplementary documents and any other materials they may create to assist the standards. **Dr. West** responded that he would be honored to help craft those documents.

Mr. Curtis thanked Dr. West for his suggestions on the one pager of key themes to include in the standards.

Mr. Bill Carey said that he is intrigued by all the names on this list, and the challenge that this committee has is that they cannot include everybody in there, so how would he advise the SRC to differentiate between who needs to be included and who does not? **Dr. West** said that this is not a document designed just for the standards, but for a general understanding of the state. The key individuals are designed to convey diversity in race, gender, and region.

Dr. Duncan thanked **Dr. West** for being here and said that Tennessee is one of the few states that test in social studies so it is important to not have cumbersome standards. She explained the purpose of as well as what will be included in the supplementary document that this committee will be creating. She asked **Dr. West** for his opinion on the supplementary document. He said that it is important to get the message about the supplementary document out to everyone. **Dr. West** also added that if they were to go through standard by standard in the draft document, he would most likely agree with 85% of it.

Ms. Rains said that she agrees with **Dr. Duncan** about the supplementary document. She asked **Dr. West** if broader standards with supplementary documents are more palatable to groups who are concerned about the removal of Tennessee history. **Dr. West** said that the groups who are very involved need to help develop the supplementary materials so that teachers do have what they need.

Mr. Roach thanked **Dr. West** for coming and invited him to stay if he would wish to be part of the discussion.

10:10 AM

Committee took a break.

10:25 AM

The committee came back together and **Mr. Roach** set up the path for how the committee would organize the day's discussion.

ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to ask the Educator Advisory Team to modify the structure of the headings and overviews to emphasize the information. Ms. Rains seconded. The motion passed unanimously with no discussion.

Kindergarten Standards

- ACTION: Mr. David Barrett moved to change "evaluate" to "describe" in standard K.06. Mr. Carey seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to change "student's street address" to the "school's street address" in standard K.10. Mr. Barrett said he is concerned about homeless students who move and do not have a permanent address. The motion failed for lack of a second.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add a new standard "K.17 Recite and understand the meaning of the pledge of allegiance." Dr. Duncan seconded. Mr. Wigginton said that he has concerns with including this standard for students who object for religious reasons. Mr. Roach said it would not trump Tennessee law that requires students to stand but not recite. Mr. Carey asked if it would be better to move this to first grade. Dr. Duncan said this is a semantics issue. Mr. Carey withdraws the motion.
- ACTION: Mr. Louis Gallo moved to revise standard K.12 to say "Identify the following state and national symbols: American flag, Tennessee flag, and the words of the Pledge of Allegiance." Mr. Wigginton seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add to the motion above "White House and Statute of Liberty." The motion failed for lack of a second.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to remove "home" and "parents" in standard K.15. Dr. Duncan seconded. Mr. Barrett said that not every child lives with their parents. Mr. Roach said that without objection, the motion is amended by Ms. Rains.
- ACTION: Ms. Rains moved to amend the previous motion to change "parents" to "caregivers". Dr. Pamela Bobo seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

- ACTION: Mr. Roach moved to reconsider the motion without objection on standard K.15 to read the same except to substitute "caregivers" in place of "parents".
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to change standard K.20 to read "Identify and discuss the following holidays:" and to add Veteran's day to the current list of four holidays. Ms. Rains seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- **ACTION:** Mr. Carey moved to add a new standard to say "Demonstrate qualities of good citizenship." Dr. Bobo seconded. Mr. Carey said that this standard currently exists in the Kindergarten standards. Dr. Duncan said that it is poorly worded as a standard, but understands why teachers would want to keep it in. Mr. Carey said that it is true with a lot of standards but he is open to new wording but thinks citizenship is important. Mr. Wigginton asked if any of the educator advisory team members could explain their thinking. Ms. Rebecca Marino said that part of the reason it was removed was that "demonstrating qualities" is not something that can be assessed and "good citizenship" is subjective. There is also a standard in first grade that is very similar so they removed the kindergarten standard. Dr. Bobo said that recently it was reported that high school students would have to take a civics test before they graduated, so wouldn't this fall under that for assessment? It can be reworded but defining citizenship for younger kids is important. Mr. Gallo said that most of the concepts in kindergarten are building to citizenship which is then stated in the first grade standards on citizenship. The motion failed with one aye and nine nays.
- ACTION: Ms. Rains moved to edit the Government and Civics overview to state "Students will learn the foundations of good citizenship including..." Mr. Wigginton seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add a new standard after K.10 "Locate Tennessee and the United States on a map." Mr. Wigginton seconded. Mr. Wigginton asked Ms. Marino to explain the advisory team's thinking. Ms. Marino said that they moved the standard to first grade where it is more developmentally appropriate. Ms. Petko said that at the last meeting, they discussed moving it to first grade with other geography standards. Mr. Carey said that he wants to listen to the educators who reviewed the current standards and said that he doesn't think this one is asking a lot. The motion failed with one aye and nine nays.
- ACTION: Ms. Rains moved to delete "inferences" from Social Studies Practices 2. Ms. Petko seconded. Ms. Rains asked Ms. Marino why all four bullet points were included in the Kindergarten social studies practices in practice number 2. Mr. Wigginton asked what grade drawing inferences would be better in. Ms. Marino answered grade 3. The motion passed unanimously.

11:05 AM

The committee took a break.

11:12 AM

The committee reconvened.

ACTION: Mr. Wigginton moved to change "recall the student's and/or school's street address, city/town, and state." in standard K.10. Mr. Barrett seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

First Grade Standards

- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to change the wording in standard 1.01 to read "define the aspects of culture." Ms. Petko seconded. Dr. Duncan said that the wording can look differently such as "describe the cultural aspects of an area". The motion was reconsidered without objection.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to amend his previous motion to state "describe the cultural aspects of a place, including a student's community and state." in standard 1.01. Mr. Roach said the motion due to the fact that it was reconsidered without objection.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to remove standard 1.11. Mr. Barrett seconded. Ms. Petko said that it didn't fit with the "state" focus in first grade, so it should be moved to second grade. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to combine standards 1.12 and 1.14 and send it back to the Educator Advisory Team to develop the exact wording. Mr. Barrett seconded. Mr. Wigginton said to clarify, the educator advisory team will reword it and bring it back to the SRC. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add the following to the first grade geography strand: Memphis, Knoxville, and Chattanooga; and the three major river systems: Mississippi, Tennessee, and Cumberland. Mr. Gallo seconded. Mr. Gallo asked if it is too much for first grade, if it is developmentally appropriate. Ms. Rains and Dr. Duncan agreed that it is not developmentally appropriate. The motion failed with one aye and nine nays.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to have the Educator Advisory Team revise standard 1.07 to be more general and ensure proper scaffolding. Ms. Rains seconded. Ms. Rains asked Ms. Marino what had changed in the different drafts. Ms. Marino admits that they did not feel real strongly either way. Dr. Duncan said the standard only uses "recognize" which is low level. Ms. Petko said she recalls that they did say that this is appropriate and fits into the grade level work when discussing the three grand divisions. Ms. Kenecia Sullivan, another Educator Advisory Team lead, said that the team did recognize that the standard is repeated in third grade. They can revisit this standard and make it broader. Mr. Carey said that he thinks that first grade is supposed to be an introduction and does not want Tennessee information to be removed. The motion passed unanimously.

- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to revise standard 1.18 to something similar to, "Explain the importance of patriotic traditions including the recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance, the performing of the National Anthem, and respectful behavior during the Pledge and playing of the National Anthem." Ms. Petko seconded. Mr. Barrett asked if this is the same standard as what is stated in Kindergarten. Dr. Duncan and Mr. Wigginton explain that it is a different concept because it deals with the evaluating and specific behavior. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to send standards 1.20 and 1.23 back to the Educator Advisory Team for accuracy of wording and to consider how to bring in equity and fairness. Mr. Carey seconded. Mr. Barrett said that he isn't really sure about "citizens of the school" wording in the standard. He doesn't know what the legal definition of the state of Tennessee. Ms. Petko said this had been a lengthy discussion in their subcommittee and they had looked up different definitions. Mr. Carey offered a different way to reword the standard. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to send standard 1.21 to the Second Grade Government and Civics strand. Mr. Wigginton seconded. Dr. Duncan said moving the standard to second grade fits with the flow of second grade better than where it is currently. Mr. Wigginton asked if they are losing the opportunity to teach about equity and fairness in first grade by removing the standard. Dr. Duncan said that there is that opportunity in standard 1.20 and 1.22. And teachers can be more explicit in teaching about equity and fairness in those two standards. The motion passed with nine ayes and one nay.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to change standard 1.17 to "identify the Governor and President and explain their roles." Dr. Bobo seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add to standard 1.24 the following, "state tree, state nickname; and explain the significance of the state nickname." Ms. Petko seconded. Mr. Curtis offered a substitution for "significance" instead of "meaning". Mr. Wigginton asked elementary teachers how they feel about the verb "explain". Ms. Bobo asked if a nickname is a symbol, according to the standard. And secondly, she said that it appeared later on as part of the War of 1812. Mr. Carey said that there is some contention for when the nickname came about and it may not be linked to a particular war. The motion passed unanimously.

12:10 PM

The committee broke for lunch.

12:50 PM

The committee reconvened.

- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add to standard 1.18 the following, "understand proper flag etiquette." Dr. Duncan seconded. Dr. Duncan asked Mr. Carey to read the current standard with flag etiquette in it for context on the motion. Mr. Wigginton asked if they could look at the feedback on the revised standards to see if there is any feedback on adding in flag etiquette. Mr. Carey asked for the Educator Advisory Team leads to explain their rationale on the old standard. Ms. Marino said that she does not remember any of their team having strong feelings either way. Mr. Wigginton said that the standards are the minimum and plenty of schools can add it then. Mr. Carey withdrew the motion to bring it up in a later grade.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to eliminate the words "analyze and" in standard 1.27. Ms. Rains seconded. Dr. Duncan said they have previously discussed reducing this standard. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to change the introduction wording in standard 1.29 to the following "identify and describe the events or people celebrated during the following national holidays and examine why we celebrate them:..." Mr. Wigginton seconded. Dr. Duncan said based on public feedback, she motions to change the wording to "identify and describe the events or people celebrated during state and national holidays and analyze why we celebrate them:..." then list the holiday. Mr. Wigginton asked for a point of clarification on adding the words "state holiday" to this list. Ms. Marino said that the wording was not done intentionally. Dr. Duncan amends the motion to strike "state and". She asked Ms. Marino for the appropriateness of the term 'analyze'. Ms. Marino said that it was important to increase the critical thinking. Dr. Duncan amends "examine" for "analyze" in the original motion. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add a standard "differentiate between fact and fiction when sharing stories or retelling events." Mr. Barrett seconded. Mr. Wigginton asked if this was already in the social studies practices. He found some similar wording in practice number 2. Dr. Duncan asked if this was already in the English Language Arts Academic Standards. Ms. Rains explained that it was in the first grade standards with tall tales, etc. Mr. Carey said that this standard is in the current standards and is very popular. Mr. Gallo asked if this was developmentally appropriate for first graders. Ms. Rains said that yes it is important and this is happening even at the Kindergarten level. The motion failed with two ayes and eight nays.

Ms. Rains asked the committee to look at the social studies practices because there were concerns in the public feedback.

Second Grade Standards

ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to delete the list after the colon in standard 2.01 so it reads "identify various cultural groups within the U.S. and in your community." Mr. Gallo seconded. Mr. Carey said that he likes Mr. Barrett's suggestion but by only deleting the list, it would

make the standard very vague. **Mr. Barrett** said that his contention with the list is that it excludes cultures. **Mr. Wigginton** asked **Ms. Marino** to come forward to explain. **Ms. Marino** said that they wanted to give some ideas to teachers, and pulled up the most recent U.S. census and pulled the top four groups. That is where the list came from. **Mr. Wigginton** asked for the census material to be included in the supplementary document. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Curtis asked for a point of privilege to ask if the Educator Advisory Team is going to go back and look at everything this committee is adopting to change. **Ms. Encalade** said that where the motions have been specific, those specifies will be added in exactly as stated. In the motions where it is more general, the Educator Advisory Team will draft a recommendation to bring before the SRC at a later date.

- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to modify standard 2.12 to read "identify and locate the four hemispheres (North, South, East, West), equator, Prime Meridian, North and South poles, and the seven continents." Mr. Wigginton seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to change standard 2.13 to read "Recognize that the U.S. is part of the North American continent and identify the countries and the Pacific Ocean, Atlantic Ocean, and Gulf of Mexico that border it." Mr. Carey seconded. Mr. Carey amends the motion for the standard to read "Recognize the U.S. is part of the North American continent and identify the countries and the Pacific Ocean, the Atlantic Ocean, and the Gulf of Mexico that border it." Mr. Gallo added the specific bodies of water names. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to change standard 2.14 to read "recognize the difference between physical and political maps." Mr. Gallo seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to add to standard 2.17 the Rocky Mountains region to the list of regions. Mr. Gallo seconded. Mr. Gallo said that the committee had originally said that they had suggested to moving it to third grade to fit in more specifically with U.S. Geography. Mr. Carey said that they may need to discuss third grade before moving more standards there. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to move standard 2.17 to the Third Grade Standards between standards 3.33 and 3.34. Mr. Wigginton seconded. Mr. Wigginton asked if they could revisit this decision depending on what the committee does with third grade. The committee held no vote on this motion and will revisit it.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add a standard to read "Locate major cities, bodies of water, etc. on a map of the U.S. to include New York, Los Angeles, Chicago, the Great Lakes, the Mississippi River, the Appalachian and Rocky Mountains." Dr. Duncan seconded. Mr. Gallo is asked the committee if this is too much to add for the second grade. Mr. Carey said that he is afraid that these revisions are losing a lot of specifics. Mr. Roach said that he heard him say that if the standard does not specifically say Mississippi River, then the

student will not learn it. **Mr. Carey** concurred and **Mr. Roach** explained why he disagrees. **Dr. Duncan** said that the standard is not the directive for the teacher. The motion failed with one aye and nine nays.

- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to delete Mt. Rushmore in standard 2.20. The motion failed for lack of a second.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to have the Educator Advisory Team reword of clarify standard 2.26. Mr. Wigginton seconded. Mr. Barrett said that there are a variety of different people who can/cannot vote such as children and felons. Ms. Marino offered the Educator Advisory Team's rationale. Ms. Petko said that the way that it is worded still leaves the teacher open to getting into a full discussion on the Constitution. Mr. Barrett said that the intent of the standard is to "examine/recognize why laws were written to protect a citizen's right to vote". The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Ms. Petko moved to remove standard 2.19 because it has been moved to first grade. Ms. Rains seconded. Mr. Wigginton asked if this is the motion because it is now in the first grade. Ms. Petko said that is also in the fourth grade. The committee discussed the developmentally appropriate wording and where it would be best according to grade. The motion passed with nine ayes and one nay.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to send standard 2.21 back to the Educator Advisory Team to revise and incorporate the spirit of the standard into second grade. Dr. Duncan seconded. The current standard 2.21 reads, "recite and analyze the lyrics of the 'Star Spangled Banner' to determine the meaning of the song and the origins of the song during the War of 1812." The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to add the Grand Canyon to standard 2.20. Ms. Petko seconded. Dr. Duncan said that the Grand Canyon is included as a landmark in a third grade standard. The motion failed with one aye and nine nays.
- ACTION: Ms. Rains moved to delete some people off the list in standard 2.28 and move others to a different grade where they fit in historically. Mr. Gallo seconded. Mr. Carey said that the wording of this standard is important because the current standard is about doing a biographical report, and the wording of the revised standard makes it appear like the teachers need to teach all nine names. Ms. Rains said it would be important to connect the names in context with the history rather than just doing a report. Ms. Rains withdraws this motion.
- ACTION: Dr. Duncan moved to send standard 2.28 back to the Educator Advisory Team to revise the list of names and use standard 2.31 as a reference for an appropriate list of names.
 Mr. Gallo seconded. Mr. Wigginton asked Mr. Carey for the name that he would like to add to the list of the names. Mr. Carey said that he would like to add Neil Armstrong. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Gallo asked if they can add 2.30 because it is so vague. **Ms. Marino** added that it is so they can learn how to use a timeline, not for any specific events.

2:40 PM

The committee took a break.

2:50 PM

The committee reconvened.

ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to delete standard 2.31. Dr. Bobo seconded. Mr. Carey said that he is not sure the content should actually be required knowledge since he has yet to meet any adult who knows. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Roach said that since the motion passed, 2.31 be will not reexamined as part of an earlier motion in conjunction with another standard. The Educator Advisory Team can use 2.31 as a reference point.

Third Grade Standards

Ms. Rains discussed social studies practices 1, 2, and 3. **Ms. Rains** asked to look at the public feedback on the first three social studies practices.

Ms. Petko said that the subcommittee should discuss how they had proposed to restructure third grade with the entire committee. **Ms. Encalade** listed specific standard numbers on the board for to illustrate what the subcommittee was demonstrating as a restructuring model. **Ms. Sullivan** presented the committee with her proposal for how to restructure third grade.

ACTION: Ms. Petko moved to reorganize the strands in third grade to the following: Geography: Maps and Globes, World Geography, U.S. and Tennessee Geography, Economics; Tennessee History: Indigenous Peoples and European Explorers; Tennessee History: Early Settlements; Tennessee History: Road to Statehood. Dr. Duncan seconded. Mr. Curtis asked if there are any standards pertaining to government in third grade. The subcommittee said no, it would appear in fourth grade. Ms. Sullivan said that she renamed the standards under Modern Tennessee to Economics in her proposal for a restructuring of third grade. Ms. Petko adds "Road to Statehood" to a new strand. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Roach asks the committee members to look through **Ms. Sullivan's** proposal with the different standards as a baseline to begin diving into the specific third grade standards. **Ms. Encalade** explained that they can adopt portions of the proposal, they do not have to adopt it all at once.

ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to adopt the World Geography section of Ms. Sullivan's proposal, which includes standards 3.36, 3.37, 3.38. Mr. Wigginton seconded. Mr. Carey said he would like to add Russia, India, and change England to Great Britain in standard 3.37 as part of World Geography. The motion passed unanimously.

- ACTION: Ms. Petko moved to adopt the Geography: Maps and Globes section of Ms. Sullivan's proposal. Dr. Duncan seconded. The "irritation system" error in standard 3.31 needs to be changed to "irrigation system". The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Ms. Petko moved to adopt the U.S. and Tennessee Geography section, which includes standards 3.32, 3.33, 3.34, and 3.24. Ms. Rains seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Wigginton moved to remove Boston and Charleston in standard 3.33 from the previous motion. Dr. Bobo seconded. The motion passed with six ayes and five nays.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to delete "Death Valley" from standard 3.34 in the previous motion. Mr. Barrett seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Ms. Rains moved to adopt the Economics section, which includes standards 3.25, 3.26, 3.27, 3.28, 3.29, 3.30. Ms. Petko seconded. The committee members agreed there would be amendments to vote on in some of those standards. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Wigginton moved to amend standard 3.28 to "describe how scarcity, supply, and demand affect prices of products." Mr. Barrett seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Wigginton moved to change "recall the student's and/or school's street address, city/town, and state." in standard K.10. Mr. Barrett seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Barrett moved to amend standard 3.30 to "analyze how people interact with their environment to satisfy their basic needs and wants, including: housing, industry, transportation, and communication." Mr. Wigginton seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- ACTION: Mr. Carey moved to amend standard 3.26 to change the wording to "compare and contrast some industries". Dr. Duncan seconded. Mr. Wigginton has trouble with the wording. Mr. Carey withdraws the motion so that the Educator Advisory Team can revisit the major industries listed in standard 3.26 to ensure that it reflects the current Census data and bring back the recommendation to the committee.

4:00 PM

Mr. Roach asked for a motion to adjourn.

ACTION: Ms. Wigginton moved acceptance. Mr. Curtis seconded. The motion passed unanimously.