



THE UNIVERSITY of TENNESSEE

KNOXVILLE • CHATTANOOGA • MARTIN • MEMPHIS • TULLOHOOMA • PULASKI

DEPARTMENT OF CAPITAL PROJECTS

Designer Recommendation

Project: Art & Architecture HVAC Upgrades
 UT Knoxville
 UT No. 540/009-16-2023

Category: Minor
 Total Budget: \$1,536,000
 MACC: \$1,342,000
 Designer Fee: \$117,950

Anticipated Project Approved: December 14, 2023

Upgrade the HVAC systems in the Art & Architecture Building. Includes all related work.

1. I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc. (ICT)

ICT's experience covers various types of buildings on the UT Knoxville campus. This work shows their capabilities in handling several different varieties of mechanical systems as well as good knowledge in anticipating what is needed for the campus. Their team is experienced and knowledgeable in their disciplines of work. They have a good working relationship with the users and they are pleased with their previous experience. Their consultant listed is The Lewis Group Architects, Inc. (Architectural). ICT is located in Knoxville, TN.

2. Facility Systems Consultants, LLC

Facility Systems Consultants' experience covers their work as a consultant engineer to architectural firms on various buildings across the campus. One project is in the Art & Architecture building at this time. Their office consists of experienced engineers who have worked on the campus for many years, and they have a good working relationship with the campus. Their team includes S&ME, Inc. (Environmental). Facility Systems Consultants, LLC are located in Knoxville, TN.

3. The Architecture Collaborative, LLC (TAC)

TAC's project experience highlights their work on several projects on campus for various renovations and mechanical / electrical upgrades. They are a good firm and have been a good service provider to the University. Their team includes Facility Systems Consultants, LLC (Mechanical / Electrical). TAC is located in Knoxville, TN.

A total of 4 firms submitted qualifications for this project. The other firm submitting is as follows:

Firm Name	Location
Hunter Architecture & Design, LLC	Nashville, TN



THE UNIVERSITY of TENNESSEE

KNOXVILLE • CHATTANOOGA • MARTIN • MEMPHIS • TULLOHOMA • PULASKI

DEPARTMENT OF CAPITAL PROJECTS

Designer Recommendation

Project: Classroom Upgrades (23/24)
UT Knoxville
SBC 540/009-17-2023

Category: Minor
Total Budget: \$5,000,000 seeking initial approval of \$1,241,000
MACC: \$1,760,000 seeking initial approval of \$840,000
Designer Fee: \$151,113 seeking initial approval of \$57,916

Anticipated Project Approved: December 14, 2023

Upgrades for classroom technology, finishes, furnishings, building systems, safety improvements, and includes all related work to complete the project.

1. The Architecture Collaborative, LLC (TAC)

TAC has project experience which highlights various classroom and office renovations as well as their work as the campus professional consultant. They are a good service provider to the University, and their firm personnel are qualified and knowledgeable. Their consultant is Facility Systems Consultants, LLC (Mechanical & Electrical). The Architecture Collaborative, LLC is located in Knoxville, TN.

2. Hunter Architecture & Design, LLC

Hunter Architecture's work covers various renovations for schools, medical, and office spaces. This work would be similar to those items needed for this project. They have not worked with the University previously. Their staff is licensed in their disciplines. Their consultants listed for this project are Klobber Engineering Services, LLC (Civil) and Community Solutions by Design, LLC (Mechanical, Plumbing, and Electrical) Hunter Architecture & Design, LLC is located in Nashville, TN.

A total of **2** firms submitted qualifications for this project.



Tennessee Technological University

Capital Projects & Planning

220 W. 10th Street, Room 116, Cookeville TN 38505
(931) 372-3524

Designer Recommendations as provided by Tennessee Tech University Capital Projects and Planning

Project: J.J. Oakley Innovation Center & Residence Hall
SBC Approval December 14, 2023

Category: Capital Improvement

Total Budget: \$153,200,000.00

MACC: \$138,568,500.00

Designer Fee: \$ 6,936,685.00

SBC Project No: 166/011-01-2023

Project Scope: Construct a new residence hall that will provide up to 800 beds and 15,000 to 20,000 square feet of ground level space dedicated to a learning community for entrepreneurship and technology.

Approval: December 14, 2023 by the SBC

1. Wier Boerner Allin Architecture, PLLC

Firm was focused on collegiate expertise/experience and listening to client. Design architect displayed great insight, experience, and clear process during the interview. Firm presents five project examples. Mississippi State’s residence hall is similar to this project. Three project examples illustrate the team’s ability to design TTU’s style of modified Georgian architecture. Mackey Mitchell Architects, their housing consultant partner, presents three residence hall examples, all appropriate and similar to this project. All proposed team members have campus housing experience except civil, and those team members have project experience at TTU. Incorporated a FEMA rated storm shelter into the Mississippi State project.

2. McCarty Holsaple McCarty Architects, Inc.

Proposal highlights collaborative process and client involvement in the design. Interview process presented information specific to this project and included flexibility to respond to project parameters within TTUs Master Plan and typical processes. The team put thought into budget, site and the footprint of the building. This will be the first collaboration project for the majority of the team members. Housing consultant presents five housing examples, all of which are similar in size to this project, one has Georgian architecture. Most of the consultant team members have some residence hall experience.

A total of 10 firms submitted qualified proposals for this project.

Firm Name	Location
Anecdote, PLC	Nashville, TN
Cope Architecture	Knoxville, TN
Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood, Inc.	Nashville, TN
Johnson Johnson Crabtree Architects, P.C.	Nashville, TN
MBI Companies Inc.	Knoxville, TN
McCarty Holsaple McCarty Architects, Inc.	Knoxville, TN
Moody Nolan, Inc.	Nashville, TN
The Orcutt/Winslow Limited Liability Limited Partnership	Nashville, TN
Upland Design Group, Inc.	Crossville, TN
Wier Boerner Allin Architecture, PLLC	Nashville, TN

Tennessee Technological University
TTU - J.J. Oakley Innovation Center & Residence Hall

RFQ Score Sheet
 Overall Evaluations & Ranking

	Qualifications & Experience										Technical										Q&E+T TOTAL	RANK
	Evaluator					Median	High	Low	Delta	Evaluator					Median	High	Low	Delta				
	1	2	3	4	5					1	2	3	4	5								
						60					0	0	0	0	0	40						
WBA Architecture	44.00	41.00	49.00	53.00	56.00	49.00	56.00	41.00	15.00	34.00	33.00	33.00	29.00	32.00	33.00	34.00	29.00	5.00	82.00	1		
McCarty Holsaple McCarty Architects, Inc.	46.00	45.50	47.00	42.00	46.00	46.00	47.00	42.00	5.00	31.00	37.00	31.00	27.00	32.00	31.00	37.00	27.00	10.00	77.00	2		
Orcutt Winslow	43.00	33.50	42.00	49.00	48.00	43.00	49.00	33.50	15.50	31.00	22.00	26.00	30.00	29.00	29.00	31.00	22.00	9.00	72.00	3		
Anecdote Architectural Experiences	42.00	36.00	44.00	40.00	35.00	40.00	44.00	35.00	9.00	33.00	25.00	28.00	29.00	31.00	29.00	33.00	25.00	8.00	69.00	4		
Upland Design Group, Inc.	43.00	32.00	37.00	47.00	36.00	37.00	47.00	32.00	15.00	33.00	26.00	25.00	28.00	36.00	28.00	36.00	25.00	11.00	65.00	5		
Goodwyn, Mills, Cawood	38.00	35.00	46.00	43.00	38.00	38.00	46.00	35.00	11.00	32.00	21.00	30.00	26.00	24.00	26.00	32.00	21.00	11.00	64.00	6		
Cope Architecture	34.00	29.50	51.00	51.00	34.00	34.00	51.00	29.50	21.50	18.00	20.00	32.00	29.00	31.00	29.00	32.00	18.00	14.00	63.00	7		
Moody Nolan	34.00	32.00	45.00	40.00	37.00	37.00	45.00	32.00	13.00	25.00	25.00	28.00	26.00	25.00	25.00	28.00	25.00	3.00	62.00	8		
Johnson Johnson Crabtree Architects, P.C.	18.00	25.00	44.00	37.00	31.00	31.00	44.00	18.00	26.00	24.00	25.00	27.00	24.00	30.00	25.00	30.00	24.00	6.00	56.00	9		
MBI Companies Inc.	29.00	27.00	30.00	41.00	27.00	29.00	41.00	27.00	14.00	19.00	20.00	25.00	29.00	23.00	23.00	29.00	19.00	10.00	52.00	10		
																			82.0			
																			High			



12/04/2023
 Campus Planning + Design
 309 Ray Herzog Building
 Memphis, TN 38152

Page 1 of 2

Designer Recommendations

Project:	Wilson School Roof Replacement
Category:	Minor
Total Budget:	\$2,250,000.00
MACC:	\$2,009,000.00
Designer Fee:	\$170,568.00
SBC Project No:	367/007-06-2023
Project Approval:	SBC 12/14/2023
Project Description:	This project will replace the deteriorated roof system on the Wilson School of Hospitality and Resort Management and all related work.

1. Evans Taylor Foster Childress Architects, P.C.

Excellent range of similar experience projects include Stream Reroof Various Buildings, UM Multiple Buildings Roof Replacements Memphis TN, Stream Readiness Center Roof Replacement Humbolt TN, Multiple Building Roof Replacement UT Health Science Center Memphis TN, and First Tennessee Bank Tower and Annex Reroof Memphis TN. Extremely responsive firm with extensive knowledge of state and campus standards. Very experienced senior staff. Consultants listed are Building Systems Group Mechanical Plumbing Electrical and Fire Protection, and Chad Stewart & Associates, Inc. Structural.

2. Urban ARCH Associates, P.C.

Great range of similar experience projects include Southaven City Hall Renovation Southaven MS, Horn Lake City Hall Roof Replacement Horn Lake MS, Wilder Youth Development Center Roof Replacements Arlington TN, and Northwest Correctional Complex Roof Replacement Tiptonville TN. Responsive firm with great knowledge of state and campus standards. Experienced staff. Consultants are HNA Engineering Mechanical Plumbing Electrical and Fire Protection, and CSA Engineering Structural.

3. LRK, Inc.

Great range of similar experience projects include Student Recreation Center ReRoof and repairs Memphis TN, Renasant Convention Center Renovation Memphis TN, FedEx Logistics Headquarters Memphis TN, Central Station Hotel Renovation Memphis TN, and Oak Haven Elementary School Memphis TN. Responsive firm with extensive knowledge of state and campus standards. Experienced staff. Consultants listed are OGCB, Inc for Mechanical Electrical Plumbing, and Burr & Cole Structural.

A total of 4 firms were solicited to submit Letters of Interest for this project, 4 firms responded with LOI's and are listed in order of ranking by UM:

1. Evans Taylor Foster Childress Architects, P.C. – Memphis TN
2. Urban ARCH Associates, P.C. – Memphis TN
3. LRK, Inc. – Memphis TN
4. SSR of TN LLC – Nashville TN

Designer Evaluation Summary

Project:	Middle Fork Bottoms Visitor Center, Maintenance Facility, and Amenities
Agency:	Department of Environment & Conservation
Category:	Standard
SBC Project No.:	126/053-01-2023
Project Approved By:	SBC
Project Approval Date:	10.12.2023
Total Project Budget:	\$22,520,000.00
Maximum Allowable Construction Cost (MACC):	\$15,245,510.00
Designer Fee:	\$884,437.00
Project Description:	Construct new visitor center, maintenance facility, boardwalk, boat ramp, trail bridges, utility infrastructure, amenities, and all required related work.

RANKING	FIRM NAME
1)	Goodwyn Mills Cawood, LLC – Submittal showcased a strong, well-qualified project team, that includes experience on Agency projects; firm has recent and relevant experience working on State projects, including for this agency; provided a good project approach.
2)	Allen & Hoshall, Inc. – Firm showcased experience on projects of similar scope; both firm and proposed team have experience working with State and are all in-house; proposed approach is acceptable.
3)	TLM Associates, Inc. – Both firm and proposed team appear to be qualified and have experience working with State; provided a detailed project approach.



Designers submitting a Letter of Interest:

FIRM NAME	LOCATION
A2H, Inc.	Lakeland, TN
Allen & Hoshall, Inc.	Memphis, TN
Anecdote, PLC	Nashville, TN
ANF Architects, Inc.	Memphis, TN
Archimania, P.C.	Memphis, TN
BHDG Architects, Inc.	Nashville, TN
CDP Architecture, LLC	Nashville, TN
Dryden Architecture and Design, PLLC	Nashville, TN
GHP, Inc.	Nashville, TN
Goodwyn Mills Cawood, LLC	Nashville, TN
Hasting Architecture and Design, LLC	Nashville, TN
HFR, Inc. / Wold Architects & Engineers	Brentwood, TN
HMK Architects, PLLC	Brentwood, TN
Hunter Architecture & Design LLC	Nashville, TN
Hurst-Rosche, Inc.	Nashville, TN
LRK, Inc.	Memphis, TN
M. Shanks Architects	Pegram, TN
ProjX, LLC	Nashville, TN
Smith Gee Studio, LLC	Nashville, TN
Tinker Ma, LLC	Chattanooga, TN
TLM Associates, Inc.	Jackson, TN

DESIGNER EVALUATION SCORE SUMMARY MATRIX
MIDDLE FORK BOTTOMS VISITOR CENTER, MAINTENANCE FACILITY, AND AMENITIES
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT & CONSERVATION

Submitting Designers	Evaluator 1		Evaluator 2		Evaluator 3		Total	Rank	Ranked Design Firms
	Raw Rank	Rank Score	Raw Rank	Rank Score	Raw Rank	Rank Score			
A2H	11	15	2	24	8	18	57.00	5	
Allen & Hoshall	5	21	4	22	7	19	62.00	2	Allen & Hoshall
Anecdote	9	17	7	19	18	8	44.00	11	
ANF Architects	4	22	8	18	21	5	45.00	8	
Archimania	13	13	9	17	17	9	39.00	13	
BHDG Architects	10	16	13	13	15	11	40.00	12	
CDP Architecture	15	11	14	12	14	12	35.00	17	
Dryden Architecture and Design	17	9	15	11	16	10	30.00	20	
GHP	14	12	19	7	12	14	33.00	19	
Goodwyn Mills Cawood	7	19	1	25	2	24	68.00	1	Goodwyn Mills Cawood
Hastings Architecture	16	10	20	6	3	23	39.00	13	
HFR	3	23	21	5	9	17	45.00	8	
HMK Architects	12	14	18	8	13	13	35.00	17	
Hunter Architecture and Design	18	8	17	9	19	7	24.00	21	
Hurst-Rosche	20	6	16	10	5	21	37.00	16	
LRK	1	25	12	14	20	6	45.00	8	
M. Shanks Architects	6	20	11	15	6	20	55.00	6	
ProjX	19	7	10	16	10	16	39.00	13	
Smith Gee Studio	8	18	6	20	4	22	60.00	4	
TinkerMa	21	5	5	21	1	25	51.00	7	
TLM Associates	2	24	4	22	11	15	61.00	3	TLM Associates