

Meeting Minutes
Tennessee State Textbook and Instructional Materials Quality Commission

Location: Cordell Hull, House Hearing Room 3

Date: September 14, 2018

Time: 11:37am

Roll Call

Member	Present	Absent
Dr. Vicki Kirk	x	
Mr. Neel Durbin	x	
Mr. Frank Cagle	x	
Ms. Karen King		x
Ms. Kelsey Reece		x
Dr. Jack Parton	x	
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x	
Ms. Michele Bowman	x	
Total	6	2

Call to Order

Dr. Vicki Kirk called the meeting to order. New and returning Tennessee Department of Education attendees were introduced by Dr. Kirk. The Textbook Commission members then introduced themselves to those attending and to those watching the live stream.

Commission Roles and Adoption Process:

Dr. Vicki Kirk discussed the purpose of standards, standards development and its review process, and the textbook commission process.

Consent Items (Voice Vote)

I. Adoption of Agenda

Dr. Vicki Kirk, Secretary

ACTION: Frank Cagle motioned, seconded by Neel Durbin to approve the adoption of the agenda.

Motion passage information: Passed unanimously

II. March 19, 2018 Meeting Minutes

ACTION: Frank Cagle motioned, seconded by Jack Parton to approve the March 19, 2018 meeting minutes as presented to the commission.

Motion passage information: Passed unanimously

Action Items (Roll Call Vote):

I. Election of 2018 Chairman

Dr. Vicki Kirk, Secretary

ACTION: Frank Cagle nominated Neel Durbin. Jack Parton motioned, seconded by Michele Bowman. The motion passed unanimously, and Neel Durbin continued the meeting in place of Dr. Vicki Kirk.

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

II. Election of 2018 Vice-Chairman

Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman

ACTION: Frank Cagle nominated Dr. Jack Parton. Ms. Michele Bowman motioned, seconded by Dr. Vicki Kirk. The motion passed unanimously.

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin, Chairman	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

III. Alternate Academic Instructional Materials Addition to Section E

Ms. Allison Gauld, Tennessee Department of Education

During the workshop, **Neel Durbin** asked if there would be limits under an alternative diploma. **Allison Gauld** stated that 1% of the student population can be considered for AAIMS except for places like Tennessee School for the Deaf, Tennessee School for the Blind, or smaller districts where the ratio would be different compared to larger districts. **Neel Durbin** said he was excited that this could help keep the rigor high for these students, and asked with the AAIMS standards is it possible to differentiate between each student when they are so diverse in their strengths and abilities. **Allison Gauld** explained that each screening instrument allows for differentiations in Section 2. **Lauren Bardwell** further explained that by adding this to Section E, the Tennessee Department of Education creates a demand for publishers to create Basal programs for students participating in AAIMS.

During the meeting, **Jack Parton** said that he is excited about this program and that the staff who is working on this should be applauded.

IV. Publisher Presentations

1. B.E Publishing

Michael Gecawich presented his appeal for the B.E. Publishing textbook titled Business & Professional Communications. This text falls under the course 5888 Business Communication.

Dr. Vicki Kirk inquired about B.E Publishing's stating in their appeal letter that the text in question is 100% aligned to Precision Exams and wondered who conducted the review that came to this conclusion. **Michael Gecawich** said the textbook was reviewed by an independent panel.

2. Pearson

Luess Sampson presented her appeal for the Pearson textbook titled Tennessee Economics. This text falls under the course 3431 Economics.

Frank Cagle asked the textbook reviewer comments about primary sources to be further explained. **Luess Sampson** pointed to standard E07, stating that to their knowledge this standard does not explicitly require students to use primary source writings written by Smith and Marx in order to compare and contrast their theories.

Frank Cagle questioned if students struggle to understand text from 200 years ago that is included in the textbook. **Luess Sampson** said with these sources being available online and with teacher support students could understand these complex texts.

Dr. Vicki Kirk asked for further clarification on Pearson's standards showing three reviewers passed and one reviewer failed each standard. **Lacey Noel** explained that in Pearson's appeal response, they are looking at each screening instrument overall, not at the reviewer's responses to each individual standard. Three reviewers had to pass the textbook overall, which did not occur.

Neel Durbin asked what adjustments were made to the text, and **Luess Sampson** pointed to the packet given to the commission, specifically to page 36 that there were changes to the material.

3. Cengage Learning

Michael Gasperic presented his appeal for the Cengage Learning textbook Burrow's Business Management. This text falls under the course 5889 Business Management.

Dr. Vicki Kirk asked if they had made any revisions before the reviewer's re-reviewed the textbook. **Michael Gasperic** said they did not.

4. EMC Publishing

Dr. Nathalie Gaillot presented her appeal for the EMC Publishing textbook T'es branche' Level 3. This text falls under the course 3043 French Level III (9-12).

Frank Cagle asked if the updates that were done in this textbook be included in the 2019 book.

Nathalie Gaillot said yes, the updating regarding culture will be.

In the appeal letter to the commission, EMC Publishing stated that if this textbook is approved, that they are planning on submitting their 2019 edition for official substitution. **Dr. Vicki Kirk, Frank Cagle, and Jack Parton** discussed the substitution process and how districts could possibly purchase this version before the 2019 version is approved.

5. Studies Weekly

Kim Mogilevsky presented her appeal for the Studies Weekly textbook Geography: Economics, and Early History. This text falls under the course 0319 Grade 3 Social Studies.

Frank Cagle mentioned errors that he found in the revised text that was presented to the commission. **Kay Kelsey** asked how many reviewers did they have and how many reviewers passed this text, and **Kim Mogilevsky** said that out of their five reviewers, one passed the textbook. **Dr. Vicki Kirk** inquired about if Studies Weekly had other texts pass the review process, to which **Kim Mogilevsky** explained that their Kindergarten, First Grade, Second Grade, Fourth Grade, and Fifth Grade titles have passed the review process.

6. McGraw-Hill Education

Dr. Darryl Fox presented his appeal for the McGraw-Hill Education textbook World History and Geography: The Middle Ages to the 1700's. This text falls under the course 0712 Grade 7 Social Studies.

The commission discussed this appeal amongst themselves, with **Frank Cagle** saying that he is concerned about this textbook since the reviewers stated there is extraneous information. **Dr. Vicki Kirk** commented that too much extra information in a textbook can make it difficult for teachers to teach around.

V. Public Comments

Jackie Archer, Tennessee Textbook Advocates

Ms. Jackie Archer spoke to the commission on behalf of Tennessee Textbook Advocates regarding the public comments that were submitted during the textbook review process.

VI. Action Items (Roll Call Vote)

A. B.E Publishing Appeal

ACTION: TDOE will bring the reviewers together for a meeting to come to consensus about their reviews. TDOE will provide the consensus remarks to the commission prior to the next meeting.

First Motion: Frank Cagle

Second Motion: Jack Parton

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

B. Pearson Appeal

ACTION: Tennessee Department of Education will create a matrix for the reviewer's comments.

First Motion: Dr. Vicki Kirk

Second Motion: Kay Kelsey

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

C. Cengage Learning Appeal

ACTION: TDOE will bring the reviewers together for a meeting to come to consensus about their reviews. TDOE will provide the consensus remarks to the commission prior to the next meeting.

First Motion: Frank Cagle

Second Motion: Michele Bowman

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

D. EMC Publishing Appeal

ACTION: TDOE will bring the reviewers together for a meeting to come to consensus about their reviews. TDOE will provide the consensus remarks to the commission prior to the next meeting.

First Motion: Dr. Vicki Kirk

Second Motion: Jack Parton

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

E. Studies Weekly Appeal

ACTION: Tennessee Department of Education will create a matrix for the reviewer's comments.

First Motion: Jack Parton

Second Motion: Kay Kelsey

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

F. McGraw-Hill Appeal

ACTION: TDOE will bring the reviewers together for a meeting to come to consensus about their reviews. TDOE will provide the consensus remarks to the commission prior to the next meeting.

First Motion: Dr. Vicki Kirk

Second Motion: Frank Cagle

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

G. Recommendation of Section D Bid List- First Read

ACTION: Approve the Section D Bid List on first read

First Motion: Jack Parton

Second Motion: Michele Bowman

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

H. Tennessee Textbook and Instructional Materials Adoption Schedule Section E- First and Final Read

ACTION: Approve the Schedule for Section E

First Motion: Jack Parton

Second Motion: Kay Kelsey

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

I. Alternate Academic Instructional Materials Addition to Section E

ACTION: Approve the addition of AAIMs

First Motion: Jack Parton

Second Motion: Michele Bowman

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

J. Section E Screening Instruments: English Language Arts, Alternate Academic Instructional Materials, and CTE- First and Final Read

ACTION: Approve all Section E Screening Instruments

First Motion: Frank Cagle

Second Motion: Jack Parton

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

K. Evidence Guides- First Read

ACTION: Approve Evidence Guides as first read.

First Motion: Jack Parton

Second Motion: Kay Kelsey

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

L. Transparency Tool – First Read

ACTION: Approve the Transparency Tool on first read

First Motion: Frank Cagle

Second Motion: Michele Bowman

Member	Yes	No	Present Not Voting
Ms. Kay Kelsey	x		
Mr. Frank Cagle	x		
Dr. Vicki Kirk, Commissioner of Education's designee	x		
Mr. Neel Durbin	x		
Dr. Jack Parton	x		
Ms. Michele Bowman	x		

The motion passed unanimously

Announcements & Notices

March 2019 Meeting Date:

March 26, 2019 (Tentative)

Adjournment Time: 2:06pm

Approved by: Rachel Brew 10/11/18