

**WORKSHOP AND MEETING MINUTES
STATE TEXTBOOK AND INSTRUCTIONAL MATERIALS QUALITY COMMISSION**

Sept. 6, 2023
10 a.m. CT

Location

In Person:
Tennessee Board of Regents
Hearing Room 100
1 Bridgestone Park
Nashville, TN 37214

Livestream: [Link](#)

Textbook Commission Workshop Agenda* (commenced at 10 a.m.)

1. Introductions of Commission Members & Opening Remarks
Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Mr. Mike Bell	Present
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Present
Dr. Linda Cash	Present
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Present
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Present
Mr. Daniel French	Present
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Present
Ms. Lee Houston	Present
Ms. Katie Capshaw	Present
Dr. Christy Wall (Non-voting Commissioner Designee)	Present
Ms. Nikki Jones-Wallace (Non-voting Commissioner Designee)	Present

Quorum Confirmed

- a. Dr. Cash thanked the group for attending.
- b. Dr. Cash reminded the commission of their roles and responsibilities, found on the Tennessee Textbook Commission [website](#), and read sections from T.C.A. § 49-6-22.
- c. Dr. Cash restated guidance about meetings procedures, requests to speak, and timeframes as found in Textbook Commission policy.

- d. Dr. Cash revisited the library guidance document (T.C.A. § 49-6-3801) passed in March 2023. She read the policies for the role of the LEA's for materials, which referenced it is the responsibility of the district to set up reconsideration requests. .
 - e. Dr. Cash mentioned that appeals occur at the school level, then can go to board of education, and finally the appeal would come to the commission by the process discussed.
 - f. Dr. Cash reviewed the policy with the group. Reminded the group that the process starts at the local level.
 - g. Dr. Wall shared that the resources are located on the Textbook Commission website under "Additional Resources."
2. Sept. 6, 2023 Commission Meeting Workshop Agenda Items
Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair
 3. Review of Science Materials Adoption Schedule
Ms. Virginia Mayfield, Senior Director TDOE
 - a. Ms. Mayfield shared the schedule with the commission. She highlighted events that would occur.
 - b. In Jan. 2024, the commission is charged with hiring the advisory panel for science. In addition, the final rubric to be used with the science instructional materials will be approved on final reading in Jan. The commission will also decide the scoring expectations for reviewing materials.
 - c. Ms. Mayfield shared that the application should be shared in Oct. 2023 per the approved science adoption schedule in the Commissioner's Update for Directors (CUFD). The advisory panel will start in April 2024. She shared a publisher meeting would be scheduled by at the end of Sept. 2023 . Additionally, the intent to bid documents would be released in Oct. 2023 and publisher responses should be returned in Nov. 2023. Ms. Mayfield highlighted that the number of bids would help the commission determine how many advisory panelist to hire.
 - d. Dr. Cash shared this is about science materials.
 - e. Ms. Mayfield shared that materials for one math course would also be reviewed with the already approved rubric.
 4. Draft Science Instructional Materials Scoring Rubric
Ms. Virginia Mayfield, Senior Director TDOE
 - a. Ms. Mayfield shared that the rubric was created similarly to the Math rubric and is based on second grade science standards.
 - b. The committee that helped develop the science standards gave feedback on the rubric, as requested by the commission.

- c. Ms. Mayfield highlighted that additional clarity was provided for scoring. Ms. Mayfield walked through the various parts of the rubric with the commission. She clarified the scores for standards would be scored using the 0, 1, 2 scale.
- d. Ms. Mayfield asked for questions. Ms. Houston asked about the scoring labels being different (2, 1, 0 vs 0, 1, 2). Ms. Mayfield asked the preference of the commission and they chose 0 (no standards met), 1 (some standards met), 2 (all standards met).
- e. Dr. Cash clarified that all science standards should be present and that should be added to the rubric.
- f. Ms. Chancellor suggested changing “metric” to “standard” on page 1. She asked about science engineering practice (SEP) being updated to include standards. She is concerned that it is not clear that 100% of the standards are taught.
- g. Dr. Cash mentioned that in the math rubric there was a statement that all materials comply with state law.
- h. Mr. Bryan suggested adding the scores definitions. Ms. Mayfield asked about moving the scoring definition. Ms. Houston mentioned adding the definition legend to each page.
- i. Dr. Cash asked for final questions and suggested moving on to the application.

5. Science Adoption Advisory Panelist Application

Ms. Virginia Mayfield, Senior Director TDOE

- a. Ms. Mayfield shared the science application was pulled from the math application. She mentioned each section of the application to the commission.
- b. Ms. Mayfield mentioned that science questions were created to ensure the applicants have a deep understanding of science content and instruction. She discussed how the hiring task is similar to the one used in mathematics in that the applicants score a portion of an OER using the rubric.
- c. Ms. Chancellor suggested removing the “Race” and “Ethnicity” question.
- d. Mr. Bell agreed with Ms. Chancellor and mentioned removing Gender from the application.
- e. Ms. Cardoza-Moore agreed with removing both from the application. She mentioned she was troubled that people in the math adoption had higher scores based on their experience and qualifications. She states that sitting on a committee doesn’t make an applicant more qualified to do this work. She asked about updating the application to include something about their experiences which qualify them to include a local advisory panel or textbook committee.
- f. Ms. Capshaw asked about Ms. Cardoza-Moore’s goal. She suggested adding what applicants have taught and how long they have been educators.
- g. Dr. Hickie mentioned asking about classroom expertise and recognition.
- h. Mr. Bell referred to T.C.A § 49-6-2201 (l)(1)(c) and that it mentioned experts could include college professors and subject-matter specialists. He asked if the department could help produce a way to update the application to include content from T.C.A § 49-6-2201 (l)(1)(c-d).
- i. Ms. Mayfield wondered if adding a question about credentials on the application.

- j. Ms. Cardoz-Moore suggested adding a requirement to submit a curriculum vitae (CV).
- k. Dr. Cash mentioned that the application pulls each part of the application. She mentioned that the commission could include requiring a CV, but the commission would not be able to verify their experience. She mentioned that uploading certifications and credentials could be verified.
- l. Ms. Houston agreed that the information would need to be verified or not included.
- m. Dr. Cash suggested working with Ms. Mayfield and Dr. Wall to draft language to bring in experience, credentials, qualifications and remove gender, race, and ethnicity.
- n. Ms. Mayfield confirmed suggested updates.

Workshop session ended at 10:36 a.m.

***The Textbook Commission Meeting will begin immediately after the workshop. The Commission will adjourn (if needed) at the time announced during the workshop or meeting.**

**Textbook and Instructional Materials Quality Commission Meeting Minutes
Sept. 6, 2023**

1. Welcome & Introductions (commenced at 10:37 a.m.)

a. Call to Order

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

b. Roll Call

Ms. Tabatha Siddiqi, Recording Secretary, Tennessee Department of Education

Mr. Mike Bell	Present
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Present
Dr. Linda Cash	Present
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Present
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Present
Mr. Daniel French	Present
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Present
Ms. Lee Houston	Present
Ms. Katie Capshaw	Present
Dr. Christy Wall (Non-voting Commissioner Designee)	Present
Ms. Nikki Jones-Wallace (Non-voting Commissioner Designee)	Present

c. Introductions of Commission Members

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

2. Consent Items (Voice Vote)

a. Adoption of Agenda

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Motion to adopt agenda items made by: Mr. Mike Bell.

Motion seconded by: Mr. Daniel French.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call vote.

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Aye
Mr. Daniel French	Aye

Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
Ms. Katie Capshaw	Aye

Adoption of the agenda passed unanimously.

3. Action Items (Roll Call Vote)

a. Approval of Minutes-March 10, 2023

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Motion to approve the minutes made by: Mr. Mike Bell.

Motion seconded by: Mr. William "Billy" Bryan.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call vote.

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Aye
Mr. Daniel French	Aye
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
Ms. Katie Capshaw	Aye

Motion passed unanimously and the minutes were approved.

b. Election of a Vice Chair

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Dr. Cash asked for nominations for the election of a Vice Chair of the Commission.

Mr. Mike Bell nominated Ms. Lee Houston.

No other nominations were offered.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call vote.

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Aye
Mr. Daniel French	Aye
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye

Ms. Katie Capshaw	Aye
-------------------	-----

Motion passed for Ms. Lee Houston to be the new Vice Chair of the Textbook Commission.

c. Science Adoption Advisory Panelist Application

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Dr. Cash asked for clarification of the suggested changes to the application.
- Ms. Mayfield shared final edits: removing gender, removing race and ethnicity, adding a question to include credentials and licensure, and adding a question to share expertise.
- Mr. Bell asked about adding the credential questions and voting on something that hasn't been seen. He asked about the process to vote remotely or for the commission to view. He also asked about sharing with the chair before releasing.
- Ms. Mayfield suggested sending the updated application to the entire commission.
- Mr. Bell repeated the request for the department to submit the language of the credential questions to the commission chair and board for review prior to it being published. The request to be brought back to a special called meeting if there are concerns about language.
- Dr. Cash clarified that the department would make changes and share out to the commission and then shared out after review and approval.
- Ms. Cardoza-Moore asked about reviewing the material before voting.
- Dr. Cash clarified that the vote would be to make the changes, if needed.

Motion to approve the Advisory Panelist Application made by: Mr. Mike Bell.

Motion seconded by: Mr. Daniel French.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call vote.

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cardoza-Moore	Aye
Mr. Daniel French	Aye
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
Ms. Katie Capshaw	Aye

Approval of the motion of the Advisory Panelist Application passed unanimously.

d. Library Materials Appeals (standing item)

None submitted for review by the deadline of Aug. 6, 2023.

- Dr. Cash shared that no appeals were submitted by the Aug. 6 deadline.

4. 2024 Meeting Dates

Special Called Meeting: Jan. 2024

- Dr. Cash requested information on setting a potential date if needed before the release of the advisory panelist application.
- Ms. Mayfield confirmed the meeting information needs to be posted on the website 10 days prior to the meeting. She suggested identifying the date that applications would be needed.
- Dr. Cash asked for the date of the application being pushed out. Ms. Mayfield confirmed the rollout date is Oct. 11, 2023, but the date could be changed.
- Dr. Cash suggested keeping the dates and setting dates, as needed. She mentioned the possibility for a virtual meeting.
- Mr. Bell mentioned an in-person quorum may be needed for others to vote remotely.
- Dr. Cash mentioned sending dates by the end of next week (Sept. 15) for the potential special called meeting.
- Dr. Cash suggested Tuesday, Jan. 16, 2024 as a possible special called meeting.
- Mr. Bell mentioned that date is during legislative session which could make Cordell Hull difficult to obtain as a meeting site.

Regularly Scheduled Meeting: March 2024

- Dr. Cash asked to look at dates for March 2024.
- Dr. Cash suggested Tuesday, March 5 or Thursday, March 7. Then suggested March 5 as the preferred date with March 7 as the alternate.

5. Other Business from the Commission

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Dr. Cash asked for other questions from the commission. None.
- Dr. Cash asked for other questions from the department.
- Dr. Wall asked to confirm the dates of Jan. 16 for in-person special called meeting and March 5 for the regularly scheduled in-person meeting.

6. Meeting adjourned by Commission Chair, Dr. Linda Cash, at 10:53 a.m.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair