



THE UNIVERSITY of TENNESSEE

KNOXVILLE • CHATTANOOGA • MARTIN • MEMPHIS • TULLAHOMA

Office of Capital Projects

Designer Recommendation

To: Ann McGauran

From: Robbi Stivers 

April 7, 2017

Project: Executive & Continuing Education Center / MAPP Building
UT Chattanooga
SBC 540/005-01-2017

Category: Minor – Direct Solicitation

Total Budget: \$1,200,000.00

MACC: \$803,000.00

Designer Fee: \$73,887.00

This project will create an Executive & Continuing Education Center in the James A. Mapp Building (1995). The center will include offices, classroom, open space for group work, and a small catering kitchen.

1. Cogent Studio, LLC

Cogent Studio submitted experience on other classroom renovation projects. The staff proposed have worked with the Chattanooga campus on various projects and the consultants proposed are knowledgeable in their respective fields. They are located in Chattanooga.

2. Hefferlin + Kronenberg Architects, PLLC

Submitted projects include ongoing tenant improvements for a private client, classroom renovations for another state agency, as well as renovation work on the UT Chattanooga campus. The staff proposed are experienced and the consultants are licensed professionals in their respective fields. They are located in Chattanooga.

A total of 3 firms were solicited for this project with 2 submitting qualifications. Firms that were solicited are as follows:

Firm Name	Location
Cogent Studio, LLC	Chattanooga
Franklin Associates Architects, Inc.	Chattanooga
Hefferlin + Kronenberg Architects, PLLC	Chattanooga



Designer Recommendations

Project: ETSU Sevierville Program Expansion
 Category: Minor
 Total Budget: \$818,000
 MACC: \$226,259
 Designer Fee: \$18,834
 SBC Project No: 166/005-01-2017

Renovate Sevierville Center to provide space for expanded programs. Work includes interior renovations, lighting, carpet, IT, and electrical modifications.

1. Community Tectonics Architects

This architecture firm submitted several projects of a similar scope. Entire proposed architecture staff and all consultants have worked together as a team on the referenced projects. In addition to mechanical, electrical, and structural consultants, this team included an environmental consultant.

2. Architects Weeks Ambrose McDonald

This architecture firm submitted projects of a similar scope. The proposed architectural staff and the electrical engineer worked together as a team on the reference projects. Other engineers did not serve on the referenced projects. Proposed consultants included mechanical, electrical and structural engineers.

3. Studio Four Design

This architecture firm submitted projects with a somewhat similar scope. The proposed staff from the architectural firm and the mechanical/ electrical firm worked together as a team on a limited number of the referenced projects. The structural engineer did not serve on the reference projects. Proposed consultants include mechanical, electrical and structural engineers.

A total of 5 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Architects Weeks Ambrose McDonald, Inc.	Knoxville
Benefield Richters Company	Knoxville
Community Tectonics Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Michael Brady, Inc.	Knoxville
Studio Four Design	Knoxville



Designer Recommendations

Project: TTU Poultry Science Complex
 Category: Minor
 Total Budget: \$2,070,000
 MACC: \$1,838,000
 Designer Fee: \$125,783
 SBC Project No: 166/011-01-2017

Construct a complex including a poultry unit and a multipurpose facility for production and processing. Experience in poultry facilities is preferred.

1. Upland Design Group

This architecture firm submitted reference projects that were the most closely related to this project, including livestock spaces. The project team is well qualified, and has worked together on the referenced projects. Consultants include mechanical, electrical, plumbing, structural, and civil engineering.

2. McFarlin Huitt Panvini

This architecture firm submitted projects that included food grade manufacturing spaces, which are very similar to a portion of this program. The principal architect worked on all reference projects; other team members served on several. Consultants include mechanical, electrical, plumbing, structural, and civil engineering.

3. Michael Brady

This architecture firm submitted projects that included a livestock area. This work is somewhat related to portions of the current project. The project team has experience on the referenced projects. Professional services in proposal include mechanical, electrical, plumbing, structural, and civil engineering.

A total of 5 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Field's Engineering Consultant Services, LLC	Crossville
Hefferlin + Kronenberg Architects, PLLC	Chattanooga
McFarlin Huitt Panvini Inc.	Nashville
Michael Brady Inc.	Knoxville
Upland Design Group	Crossville



Designer Recommendations

Project: DSCC Glover Building Nursing Program Expansion
 Category: Minor
 Total Budget: \$1,075,000
 MACC: \$525,000
 Designer Fee: \$125,783
 SBC Project No: 166/017-01-2017

Renovate nursing instructional areas, including laboratories, equipment, and asbestos abatement to expand program capacity.

1. TLM Associates, Inc.

This firm exhibits very good experience, with multiple projects similar in scope, including nursing classrooms and labs. The team includes all disciplines, and is well-qualified. The consultants proposed worked on most of the relevant projects listed as part of the design team. MPE and Environmental consultants were listed, with all other services provided in-house.

2. McGehee Nicholson Burke Architects, PC

The firm has completed several renovation and new construction projects on the DSCC campus, including a lab renovation at the Glover building in 2007. The consultants proposed didn't work on any of the relevant projects listed. MPE and Environmental consultants were proposed. No Civil or Structural consultants were listed.

3. Vaughan Associates Architects, Inc.

The firm listed two healthcare-related projects that were renovations and system upgrades. The architectural team worked on most of the relevant projects; but the consultants proposed worked on only a few. MPE, Structural, Civil Environmental, ADA, and Hardware consultants were listed.

A total of 3 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
McGehee Nicholson Burke Architects, PC	Memphis
TLM Associates, Inc.	Jackson
Vaughan Associates Architects, Inc.	Jackson



Designer Recommendations

Project: MSCC Advanced Robotics Training Center
 Category: Standard
 Total Budget: \$5,500,000
 MACC: \$3,787,000
 Designer Fee: \$244,174
 SBC Project No: 166/021-01-2017

Construct facility at the McMinnville campus for robotics training classrooms and laboratory space. Project includes site, utilities, and parking.

1. Gilbert/McLaughlin/Casella Architects

Section B of the proposal includes projects very similar in scope to the robotics lab. The projects include highly technical spaces, class rooms and class labs. The designer provided planning for the Warren Co. Industrial Board and is familiar with the program. The proposed design team has strong experience with this type of project. The consultant team of MEP, Civil and Structural designers has good experience and includes a landscape architect and an interior designer.

2. Bauer Askew Architecture pllc

The designer has strong experience designing projects with an emphasis on classrooms and class labs/technical spaces. The proposed team of designers and consultants have worked on many projects. The consultant team includes MEP, Civil and Structural engineers as well as an interior designer and technology specialist.

3. Upland Design Group, Inc.

The proposal includes four projects that include classrooms, vocational programs in K-12 and construction of a robotic lab used for manufacturing. The design team on the submitted projects and their consultants are the same as the team proposed for this project. The consultant team includes MEP, Structural, and Civil engineers.

A total of 12 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Bauer Askew Architecture, pllc	Nashville
Gilbert / McLaughlin / Casella Architects	Nashville
Goodwyn, Mills, & Cawood, Inc.	Nashville
Hefferlin + Kronenberg Architects, PLLC	Chattanooga
Johnson + Associates Architects, LLC	Goodlettsville
Kenyon Calhoun Workshop	Nashville
Kline Swinney Associates	Nashville
Michael Brady, Inc.	Knoxville
Moody Nolan, Inc.	Nashville
Street Dixon Rick Architecture, PLC	Nashville
TMPartners, PLLC	Brentwood
Upland Design Group, Inc.	Crossville



Designer Recommendations

Project: VSCC Warf Science Building Addition and Renovation
 Category: Standard
 Total Budget: \$6,200,000
 MACC: \$5,442,500
 Designer Fee: \$299,756
 SBC Project No: 166/025-01-2017

Renovate the Warf Building and construct a new Mechatronics Lab addition. Project is approved for full planning. The current total funding is \$1,750,000 with the expectation of total funding up to \$6,200,000.

1. **Bauer Askew Architecture, pllc**
 All of the submitted projects include specialty and class lab experience. Examples include the renovation of the Motlow State – McMinnville mechatronics lab and an addition/renovation at MLK Academic Magnet High School which included engineering labs. All of the submitted projects were for educational institutions. The design team was consistent throughout the submitted projects. Consultants include structural, plumbing, mechanical, electrical, interiors and a technology specialist.
2. **J Holmes Architecture, PLLC**
 Substantial specialty lab and mechatronics design experience. Examples include a new mechatronics lab for the TCAT Dickson – Clarksville Campus and planning for the new mechatronics lab for the Center for Engineering Technology Arts and Sciences (CETAS) at ChSCC. All five submitted projects had common elements with the proposed project, including one addition/renovation project. Consultants include civil, structural, plumbing, mechanical, and electrical.
3. **BarberMcMurry architects**
 Higher-ed experience includes three new University of Tennessee projects. All three projects included lab and class lab spaces. All five submitted projects were for educational institutions, including one addition/renovation project. Most of the design team worked together on the submitted projects. Consultants include civil, structural, plumbing, mechanical, and electrical.

A total of 9 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
BarberMcMurry architects	Knoxville
Bauer Askew Architecture, pllc	Nashville
Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood, Inc.	Nashville
J Holmes Architecture, PLLC	Nashville
Johnson + Associates Architects, LLC	Goodlettsville
Lose & Associates, Inc.	Nashville
Moody Nolan, Inc.	Nashville
Street Dixon Rick Architecture, PLC	Nashville
TMPartners, PLLC	Brentwood



Designer Recommendations

Project: TCAT – Knoxville Training Facility and Renovation
 Category: Major
 Total Budget: \$19,200,000
 MACC: \$15,750,000
 Designer Fee: \$272,316
 SBC Project No: 166/060-Ander

Expand programs offsite offering Welding, Machine Tool, Diesel, Truck Driving, Automotive, Industrial Maintenance, and Special Industry training. Project will include one or more buildings located in the Knoxville area to support new or expanded programs plus renovations at the main campus.

1. Johnson Architecture, Inc

This firm’s relevant projects included examples of TCAT facilities with similar programs. Projects included Automotive, Industrial Maintenance, Machine Tool Technology, and Welding. Proposed team members and consultants worked on the referenced projects. Proposed team includes a programming consultant, civil, structural, mechanical, plumbing and electrical engineers.

2. Adams Craft Herz Walker, Inc

This firm’s submission included TCAT projects with Welding, Machine Tooling, and Industrial Maintenance spaces. The principal architect has experience on all the referenced projects. Consultants include civil, structural, mechanical, plumbing and electrical engineers.

3. Upland Design Group, Inc.

This firm’s submission included TCAT and Automotive Maintenance projects. The project team has worked together on several of the projects. Consultants include civil, structural, mechanical, plumbing and electrical engineers.

A total of 18 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Adams Craft Herz Walker, Inc.	Oak Ridge
Architects Weeks Ambrose McDonald, Inc.	Knoxville
BarberMcMurry architects	Knoxville
Bullock Smith & Partners, Inc.	Knoxville
Community Tectonics Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Cope Architecture	Knoxville
Design Innovations Architects	Knoxville
Dollar & Ewers Architecture, Inc.	Knoxville
Hefferlin + Kronenberg Architects, PLLC	Chattanooga
Johnson Architecture, Inc.	Knoxville
McCarty Holsaple McCarty, Inc.	Knoxville
Michael Brady, Inc.	Knoxville
Red Chair Architecture, Inc.	Knoxville
Smee + Busby Architects	Knoxville
Sparkman & Associates Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Studio Four Design	Knoxville
The Lewis Group Architects, Inc.	Knoxville
Upland Design Group, Inc.	Crossville



Designer Recommendations

Project: TCAT – Pulaski
 Category: Minor
 Total Budget: \$3,171,350
 MACC: \$1,630,000
 Designer Fee: \$140,872
 SBC Project No: 166/080-01-2017

Renovate a recently purchased vacant car dealership including a 13,000 s.f. building and 3 acre lot adjacent to main campus. The building will house new and expanded programs. Renovate spaces in the existing TCAT campus building.

1. Cope Architecture

The designer indicates strong experience in the renovation of educational facilities which included mechanical, electrical and plumbing updates. Several of the projects involve extensive renovations for vocational training programs. The projects listed included design elements that are very similar to the scope of the TCAT Pulaski renovation. The project manager has worked on four of the five project examples and the design team is consistent throughout all five of the Section B examples.

2. Street Dixon Rick Architecture LLC

The project experience indicated in Section B is a combination of new construction and renovations of higher ed facilities. The design team and consultants are consistent on the projects listed in Section B, however the project manager has not been a part of the team on any of the five projects listed.

3. Johnson + Associates Architects, LLC

The designer has limited experience with renovation of educational facilities, however one project renovated a car dealership in to a similar scope of the TCAT Pulaski project. The project team is consistent in the projects listed, however the consultants do not have any experience with the team as it is proposed.

A total of 4 firms submitted Letters of Interest for this project:

Firm Name	Location
Cope Architecture	Knoxville
Johnson + Associates Architects, LLC	Goodlettsville
Lose & Associates, Inc.	Nashville
Street Dixon Rick Architecture, PLC	Nashville



DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: War Memorial Plaza – Gulf War Monuments
Agency: Veterans Services
Category: Minor
SBC Project No.: 529/000-03-2016
Project Approval Date: 08/11/2016
Total Project Budget: \$ 190,000.00
MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 169,950.00
Designer Fee: \$ 14,578.00
Project Description: Construct Gul (Middle East) War Monuments on War Memorial Plaza

RANKING	RECOMMENDATION
1)	Tuck-Hinton Architects, PLLC – Submittal indicates that firm has relevant project experience on similar project; firm is very family with project location; firm’s location in close proximity to side is added bonus.
2)	N/A
3)	N/A

Other Firms Submitted: None

10

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Regional Consolidated Facility – New Jackson Crime Lab Consolidated Facility

Agency Tennessee Bureau of Investigation

Category: Major

SBC Project No.: 500/004-01-2016

Project Approval Date: 08/11/2016

Total Project Budget: \$ 24,505,400.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$19,997,559.70

Designer Fee: \$1,137,892.00

Project Description: This project will design and construct a Consolidated Regional TBI Headquarters.

RANKING	SCORE	FIRM
1)	95.00	The Lewis Group Architects, Inc., P.C.
2)	92.00	Kline Swinney Associates
3)	88.67	Kennon Calhoun Workshop, PLLC

Other Firms Submitted: brg3s Architects; Fleming Architects; Gobbell Hays Partners, Inc.; HFR Design; Johnson + Associates Architects, Inc.; Moody Nolan, Inc.; Pickering Firm, Inc.; Spirit Architecture Group, Inc.; TLM Associates; TMPartners, PLLC

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

1) Firm: The Lewis Group Architects, Inc., P.C.

Comments: Firm showcased extensive previous experience on projects of similar scope and size, including the TBI facility in Knoxville. Project approach was well balanced, detailed, and emphasized importance of establishing roles and working with the CM/GC.

2) Firm: Kline Swinney Associates

Comments: Firm has previous experience on similar projects, including the TBI facility in Nashville. Submittal showcased experience with labs and the importance of working as a team with the CM/GC

3) Firm: Kennon Calhoun Workshop, PLLC

Comments: Firm has previous project experience on similar projects, including work at the TBI facility in Knoxville. Project approach focused on collaboration in the design process and working with the CM/GC